<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MPRAM</td>
<td>Mineral Resources and Petroleum Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STDs</td>
<td>Sexually transmitted diseases</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LEIA</td>
<td>Law on Environmental Impact Assessment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FP</td>
<td>Family planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DV</td>
<td>Domestic / family violence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LDV</td>
<td>Law on Domestic violence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NSCT</td>
<td>National Study Center of Trauma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RCCP</td>
<td>Regulatory council on crime prevention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WVI</td>
<td>World Vision International</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SDG</td>
<td>Sustainable Development Goals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TPP</td>
<td>Thermal power plant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GES</td>
<td>General education school</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CM</td>
<td>Contraception methods</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSO</td>
<td>Civil society organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MFWA</td>
<td>Mongolian Family Welfare Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MGL</td>
<td>Mongolia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSDV</td>
<td>Sustainable development vision of Mongolia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MASWL</td>
<td>Mongolian association to support women’s labor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MW</td>
<td>Megawatt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNFPA</td>
<td>United Nations Population Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNFCCC</td>
<td>United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SISS</td>
<td>Social indicator sample survey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IO</td>
<td>International organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SBD</td>
<td>Sukhbaatar district</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PSE</td>
<td>Preschool education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non-governmental organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SDG</td>
<td>Sustainable development goal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SDV</td>
<td>Sustainable development vision</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CC</td>
<td>Climate change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HPP</td>
<td>Hydropower plant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INDC</td>
<td>Intended nationally determined contributions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VNR</td>
<td>Voluntary national review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ODA</td>
<td>Official development aid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NPHS</td>
<td>National population and housing census</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GEC</td>
<td>Gender equality center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KhUd</td>
<td>Khan-Uul district</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HT</td>
<td>Human trafficking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NCAV</td>
<td>National Center Against Violence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FHR</td>
<td>Forum for Human Rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GPD</td>
<td>General Police Department</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCO</td>
<td>Swiss Cooperation Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MTEP</td>
<td>Midterm Energy Program</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
This report is created with the contribution of:

SDG-1  G.Urantsooj  Centre for Human Rights and Development
S.Tsendbaatar  Global Meridian
SDG-2  G.Oyuntuya  Consumer Fund
G.Urantulkhuur  Food Coalition
SDG-3  B.Munkhtsetseg  Mongolian Family Welfare Association
Ch.Semjidmaa  Psychological Responsiveness
B.Gereltuya  Princess Center
SDG-4  D.Tungalag  All for Education National Coalition
SDG-5  D.Enkhjargal  MonFemNet National coalition
SDG-7  D.Sukhgerel  OT Watch
SDG-8  Sh.Ariunaa  Association to Support Mongolian Women’s Labor
SDG-10  G.Urantsooj  Centre for Human Rights and Development
SDG-11  G.Norovsuren  Eco Industrialization Innovation Fund
SDG-12  G.Oyuntuya  Consumer Fund
L.Dolgormaa  Environment, Health Center
R.Nyamdorj  Zasha Uvs Center
SDG-13  N.Bayarsaikhan  Steps Without Borders
B.Battogtokh  Mitchell Foundation
SDG-15  N.Bayarsaikhan  Steps Without Borders
SDG-16  B.Suvd  National Center Against Violence
B.Tuya  Gender Equality Center
Campaign for Beautiful Hearts
World Vision Mongolia International
Globe International
SDG-17  L.Dugarmaa  Development Observer
N.Oyuntuya  Consumer Fund
N.Tungalag  Social Partnership Network
Report compiled by:
B.Tserenkhand  Psychological Responsiveness
CONTENT

PREAMBLE..........................................................................................................................4
I.  INTRODUCTION .............................................................................................................5
II.  CSO STRATEGY TO PREPARE THE REPORT ............................................................6
III. GENERAL CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS ........................................8
IV. IMPLEMENTATION STATUS OF SDGS (within scope of selected targets ) ...........10
    SDG-1. End poverty in all its forms ..............................................................................11
    SDG-2. Zero hunger .......................................................................................................13
    SDG-3. Health ................................................................................................................15
    SDG-4. Supporting quality education ...........................................................................17
    SDG-5. Ensure gender equality and women empowerment ..........................................21
    SDG-6. Provide water and sanitation facilities ...............................................................23
    SDG-7. Introduce renewable energy ..............................................................................24
    SDG-8. Support decent job and economic growth .........................................................25
    SDG-10. Reduce inequalities ........................................................................................27
    SDG-11. Friendly cities, support citizens’ participation .................................................29
    SDG-12. Support responsible consumption ....................................................................31
    SDG-13. Reduce impact of climate change .................................................................33
    SDG-14. Protect ocean and sea resources ....................................................................35
    SDG-15. Protect terrestrial ecosystem .........................................................................35
    SDG-16. Build peace and ensure justice ........................................................................39
    SDG-17. Strengthen partnerships for development .....................................................43
V. DEVELOPMENT CHALLENGE: AIR POLLUTION ..................................................45
VI. RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FURTHER ACTIONS ......................................................51
PREAMBLE

Countries of the world must present their reports at least twice by 2030 on implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals which were jointly drafted and approved in 2015. Mongolia shall be presenting its first report to the UN High Level Political Forum in July of 2019. As the Government of Mongolia prepared its Voluntary National Review report, the “SDGs and CSOs” network of Civil Society Organizations presents its independent report. We envisioned and created this report as an opportunity to implement the principle to ensure multi-stakeholder participation in VNR, to contribute in the Government review, to support cooperation of the Government and CSOs, to deliver voices of the citizens to the global community and to ensure progress in each sector where we work.

We wanted to learn how the global SDGs are adapted to Mongolian conditions and to see the implementation progress of crucial goals which are significant for daily lives of everyone in Mongolia including poverty, food security, health service, education, inequality, living and working environment from our perspectives. The “SDGs and CSOs” network appreciates the Government for their open cooperation, organization of discussions and meetings during the preparations of VNR report on SDGs and targets implementation; and inclusion of CSOs views, conclusions and recommendations in the VNR at satisfactory level.

We extend our gratitude to UNDP Mongolia for the financial support to prepare, draft and translate the CSOs report. We also grateful to World Vision Mongolia for financial support in printing this report.

The activities of the “SDGs and CSOs” network shall not be restricted with the VNR as we are encouraging the members of the network to annually report on progress in the implementation of SDGs relevant to their work fields and submit recommendations on the status, results and actions to be carried in the future to the SDG National Council, UN and international organizations in the region. I believe that this Mongolian Civil Society joint report shall make a certain contribution to implementation of the SDGs and targets.

“SDGs and CSOs” network coordinator / G. Urantsooj/
I. INTRODUCTION

Voluntary National Review (VNR) is the globally accepted path to share the success, achievement, best practices, challenges, lessons learnt and actions to take to advance the implementation of global sustainable development goals (SDGs) 2030. The VNR shall also support the implementation of SDGs through encouraging cooperation of sectors, expand partnerships to improve the state policies and strengthen the existing structures. Country reviews are discussed on the United Nations High Level Political Forum (HLPF).

The CSOs network of Mongolia presents this first joint report on SDGs and targets related to their areas of work and challenges faced. The 2019 SDG implementation report is called to address the activities to “Empower people and ensure access and equality”. Mongolia shall be specifically presenting “air pollution” as one of development issues. The CSO report reviews the current conditions of the implementation of SDGs and targets which are directly related to CSO activities as well as the challenges faced.

The CSOs believe that implementation of SDGs directly depends on the inclusion of SDGs in national policies and programmes of Mongolia and their coordination. For this purpose, we have specifically reviewed the inclusion of the solutions, measures to ensure implementation of SDG targets and indicators in the MSDV-2030 adopted in 2016, “Three pillar development policy” ratified by the resolution 42 of the Government in 2018, Government platform for 2016-2020 and its action plan and relevant national programs, policy papers of the sectors.

PARTICIPATION OF CIVIL SOCIETY ORGANIZATIONS

Member organizations of the “SDGs and CSOs” network have cooperated to finalize the report on implementation of SDGs. CHRD had jointly with the national network MONFEMNET conducted an assessment on understanding, information and implementation of SDGs in the countryside. A survey to determine the population group with risk of being left behind was jointly organized by the Association to support Mongolian Women’s labor and Khugliin Khelkhe NGO. They worked on the waste disposal site of the capital city and conveyed the information about the people living there to the state. Globe International Center NGO conducted a study on implementation covering SDG target 16.10 and made an assessment on the status of information transparency and the right to access information and organized a multi-stakeholder consultation.

World Vision International had initiated the first consultation “Mongolian Children: Sustainable Development Goals – 2030” within the framework to report the implementation of SDGs. The purpose of the consultation was to improve knowledge of children on the SDGs, presentation on selection of a representative of Mongolian children to attend the UN HLPF, conduct the first stage of the selection process, including the proposal and initiatives of children for the VNR report. Consultation discussions were held in five areas including education, health, protection of children’s right, child participation, family economy and consumption. The consultation is believed to have a significant impact on promoting understanding of SDGs and implementation. The Volunteer organization network organized “Participation of volunteers to ensure sustainable development”. Providing opportunities to public to participate in sustainable development is the contribution of the volunteers in SDGs. The National Coalition “All for Education” had jointly organized the national consultation on “Localizing SDG-4 in Mongolia” together with the stakeholders. Various books, leaflets, videos were produced to improve knowledge of citizens and CSOs to better understand the SDG-4 and multi-stakeholder symposium had took place on SDG-4.7 on education of global citizens.

XIII conference of “Through women’s eyes: Air pollution and Health of mothers and children” organized by the MONFEMNET, the national network was a significant event to share knowledge and experience. Many civil society organizations, networks, coalitions had supported the preparation of the VNR to promote SDGs, providing information to all levels of state administration and to open opportunities to assess the implementation of SDGs. We believe in future cooperation to ensure success.
II. CSO STRATEGY TO PREPARE THE VNR

Civil society organizations of Mongolia formed a network “SDGs and CSOs” in December of 2017 to make own contribution to implement SDGs and to ensure everyone’s access to development results. We understand the development result as “the progress to end poverty, ensure gender equality, protect and ensure environmental balance and to improve citizens’ capacities to have access to information, participate in decision making and hold accountability” specified by the international civil society organizations.

We have defined the objective of the network to contribute in implementation of the SDGs through promoting SDGs, targets to citizens, mobilize their resources, cooperate and develop partnership with multi-stakeholders in the local communities, provide support to public to actively participate in the development process. As the Government of Mongolia had prepared the VNR on implementation of global SDGs and shall be presenting it to the United Nations High Level Political Forum (HLPF), the member organizations of the network had actively taken part in preparation of the VNR and expressed an aspiration to contribute in VNR preparing a report on implementation of SDGs related to their field of activities. The request was accepted by the National Development Agency of Mongolia which leads the preparation of the Government report and included a representative of the network in the working group formed by the Government to prepare the VNR. Network organizations had actively participated in the consultation to define the scope and content of the VNR report. Network organizations joined to implement the following strategies and objectives to participate in the preparation process of VNR report:

- Network organizations to form teams to work on every SDG to prepare the report;
- Report of the network organizations to be reflected and contributed to the VNR report;
- Proposals and recommendations of the network organizations to be included in the conclusion and future actions of the VNR report.

Network report is structured on each SDG as:

CURRENT SITUATION,

CHALLENGES INCLUSION IN THE POLICY

PROPOSALS, RECOMMENDATIONS in the report and written by the network within the scope of their activities. We aimed to include brief introduction and opinions on challenges of each civil society organization involved in the report. The network report mainly focused on how the globally agreed SDGs, targets and indicators to measure their implementation are included in the MSDV-2030 and other national policies and programs. Because, we believe that opportunity for complete implementation SDGs and targets will be created through localization and reflection of SDGs, targets and indicators in national policies and plans.

The Great Ikh Khural of Mongolia (Parliament) ratified the Mongolia’s Sustainable Development Vision (MSDV) with 44 objectives and 20 indicators with the resolution 16 of 2016 as the beginning to instill global SDG-2030 program with 17 goals, 169 targets and 244 indicators approved in 2015 by the high level forum of the UN General Assembly. The report of the NDA defined\(^1\) that the MSDV2030 is the document which includes 13 SDGs and 43 targets. According to 2018 assessment of the NSO on readiness of data to assess the implementation of the SDGs\(^2\), information to assess 118 indicators of the global SDGs are ready to be used.
We believe that presentation of the draft version including proposals and recommendations delivered during the five consultations with the various working groups of CSO to the experts group on drafting VNR report, Working group on preparation of VNR report was the significant step for us in the process to prepare the report on the implementation of the SDGs. Network organizations had actively participated in the National consultation on VNR report and expressed their opinions, ideas and recommendations. Once the VNR report shall be publicly disclosed, we will assess the inclusion of the CSO proposals and recommendations in the VNR report and shall plan future actions.

We are presenting this CSO report on implementation of the SDGs prepared by the “SDGs and CSOs” network of Mongolia not only to the audiences in Mongolia but also to the regional and global audiences in English version.

---


2 http://sdg.gov.mn/Home/Availability
III. GENERAL CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Policy and mechanism to implement SDGs, targets in Mongolia:

Situation, Recommendation

**Situation 1. Reflection of SDGs, targets in Development policy of Mongolia**

SDGs and targets are not yet fully included in the MSDV-2030, national, sectoral, local development policies and programmes. The indicators to measure the implementation of SDGs and targets are not defined as well. Therefore, no work has been done to plan and budget activities to implement the SDGs and data is not fully available on all targets.

**Recommendation 1. To start implementation of the SDGs through complete inclusion in the development policies and define targets and indicators to measure the implementation.**

Required to fully integrate and include SDGs and targets in the MSDV-2030, national, regional, local and sectoral development policies and programmes. Start to develop targets and measuring indicators for implementation of SDGs with public participation without delay. Ensure data availability and accessibility to public and include annually SDGs and targets in the socio-economic development framework plan, budget funding and report implementation and assessments to public.

**Situation 2. No structure and mechanism on integrated policy approach to ensure coordination and coherence of policies of the sectors within the three pillars of SDGs.**

Currently the NDA is in charge to execute the responsibility to ensure and regulate the integration of policies of the sectors within the scope of three pillars of SDGs, monitor, assess and plan the implementation of SDGs. However, the NDA has no full authorities to execute its responsibility.

**Recommendation 2. To establish a structure and mechanism to implement integrated policy approach to ensure coordination and coherence of sectors policies within the three pillars of SDGs.**

An amendment should be made to the Law on Development policy and planning to grant required authorities to the NDA to ensure and coordinate the integration of policies of the sectors, monitor, assess and plan the implementation of the SDGs.

**Situation 3. No multi-stakeholder consultation mechanism to eliminate breaches of sector policies.**

Development (long, mid, short-term, national, regional, local and sector) policy balance and coherence cannot be ensured. Inconsistencies between national and local development policies, mineral exploitation and environmental policies; violations of citizens’ rights by large development projects have an adverse impact on livelihoods of citizens. Development policies and programmes of the sectors are also subject of multi-stakeholders discussions, for instance, issues which are supposed to be discussed jointly by teachers, parents, school administration, sector specialists are attempted to be solved by one party without any progress. Such situation is observed in many sectors including health, food, agriculture and more.

**Recommendation 3. To establish a multi-stakeholder consultation mechanism for solving policy conflicts and contradictions within and between sectors**

There is a need to establish a multistakeholder consultation mechanism to discuss and find solutions on policy conflicts and contradictions between sectors, to balance interests of parties in the NDA. In case of sector policy conflicts, a multi-stakeholder consultation mechanism needs to be established in each ministry.
Situation 4. SDGs and targets are not included in the activities of the Ministries

The socio-economic indicators and performance indicators of activities reports of the Ministries do not reflect the SDGs goals and targets related to leaving no one behind, strengthening participatory good governance, reducing inequality, eliminating poverty, ensuring gender equality and protecting environment. Therefore activities of the Ministries may not bring significant contributions towards solution of the above cross sectoral issues.

**Recommendation 4.** Ensure full reflection of the SDGs and targets in activities of the Ministries

Improve the monitoring and evaluation structures of Ministries in compliance with the SDGs and targets. For this purpose, the socioeconomic indicators and performance indicators of the ministries should be measured for the contributions made in leaving no one behind, strengthening participatory good governance, reducing inequality, eliminating poverty, ensuring gender equality and protecting environment as specified in the SDG-2030.

Situation 5. CSO participation is not fully ensured, CSOs knowledge, experience and voluntary work is not mobilized for implementation of SDGs.

CSOs contribute in implementing state duties to protect public interests, environment, and to deliver development benefits to all and at the same time CSOs monitor performance of state organizations. They also provide opportunities to organize and mobilize voluntary involvement of citizens. However there is no mechanism to ensure regular participation of CSOs in developing, planning, assessing and monitoring of development policies and lack of policies and regulations to support voluntary work of citizens. None of ministries, agencies, local administrative organizations have clear policies and procedures when and how to cooperate with CSOs. Currently, CSO participation is restricted with one-time meeting, conference. It’s common for the working groups, committees of the state organizations to engage and include “own” CSOs. This situation may continue during the implementation of SDGs. CSOs strive to stop this tendency and make their contributions in the implementation of SDGs at all levels. “SDGs and CSOs” network aims to conduct annual assessment and conclusion on SDGs implementation until 2030.

**Recommendation 5.** Institutionalize participation of CSOs in implementation of SDGs

To support activities of CSOs which ensure participation of citizens and organize voluntary work, to develop and execute procedures to have representatives of the CSOs in the structure under the Parliament, Government, NDA, ministries, agencies, local administration and citizens’ representatives councils in the process of implementation of SDGs. To consult with “SDGs and CSOs” network to select the CSO representatives.
STATUS OF IMPLEMENTATION OF SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT GOALS
SDGs and CSOs network

SDG-1. No poverty

According to the official statistics, the poverty rate reached 29.6 per cent in 2016, increasing from the previous year. This tendency demonstrates a tough challenge to reduce the poverty rate down to 18% for the period of 2016-2020 as reflected in MSDV-2030.

State actions:
Children’s allowances, Food stamp, Mothers with salaries, Target household programmes and other social care and protection measures.

Challenges:
• Access to the Children’s allowances, Food stamps is not satisfactory. Many examples of the programmes not reaching the target recipients.
• Methodology to determine the household livelihood level failed to reflect nation specific characters.

INCLUSION IN THE POLICY

MSDV-2030 Target 2.2.1.1 to end all types of poverty is in-line with the global SDGs.
A significant provision 18.3 of the Law on Social Care of Mongolia which provides a social welfare service organization of province, capital city, district to estimate funds required for public participation centered social care service based on the proposal of soum, khoroo committee to support livelihoods and submit to a state administrative organization in charge of social care is not being executed.

National programs “Improvement of development and protection of target households”, “Food stamp” fail to reach its target audience.

PROPOSALS, RECOMMENDATIONS

Lack of cohesive policy on poverty reduction. Activities to reduce poverty can be defined as insufficient.

No integrated policy on poverty reduction. Access to measures on poverty reduction is insufficient, poor quality, doesn’t reach out the target audience and has no control. Mongolia needs to clearly define poor and measurement of shortage. Therefore, we propose to immediately implement the following measures:
• To have cohesive policy, programme to eliminate poverty,
• Improve methods, methodology to estimate the poverty, with consideration of national specifics.
• Support employment through small and medium businesses, retail sales and family businesses affordable for poor families
• Provide free professional trainings to working age citizens of very poor families, specifically youth,
• To reach out population with high risks of being left out in cooperation with CSOs and provide CSOs with technical and financial support

State actions:
Children’s allowances, Food stamp, Mothers with salaries, Target household programmes and other social care and protection measures.

Challenges:
• Access to the Children’s allowances, Food stamps is not satisfactory. Many examples of the programmes not reaching the target recipients.
• Methodology to determine the household livelihood level failed to reflect nation specific characters.

INCLUSION IN THE POLICY

MSDV-2030 Target 2.2.1.1 to end all types of poverty is in-line with the global SDGs.
A significant provision 18.3 of the Law on Social Care of Mongolia which provides a social welfare service organization of province, capital city, district to estimate funds required for public participation centered social care service based on the proposal of soum, khoroo committee to support livelihoods and submit to a state administrative organization in charge of social care is not being executed.

National programs “Improvement of development and protection of target households”, “Food stamp” fail to reach its target audience.

PROPOSALS, RECOMMENDATIONS

Lack of cohesive policy on poverty reduction. Activities to reduce poverty can be defined as insufficient.

No integrated policy on poverty reduction. Access to measures on poverty reduction is insufficient, poor quality, doesn’t reach out the target audience and has no control. Mongolia needs to clearly define poor and measurement of shortage. Therefore, we propose to immediately implement the following measures:
• To have cohesive policy, programme to eliminate poverty,
• Improve methods, methodology to estimate the poverty, with consideration of national specifics.
• Support employment through small and medium businesses, retail sales and family businesses affordable for poor families
• Provide free professional trainings to working age citizens of very poor families, specifically youth,
• To reach out population with high risks of being left out in cooperation with CSOs and provide CSOs with technical and financial support

According to the official statistics, the poverty rate reached 29.6 per cent in 2016, increasing from the previous year. This tendency demonstrates a tough challenge to reduce the poverty rate down to 18% for the period of 2016-2020 as reflected in MSDV-2030.

Source: Poverty profile study, 2016 NSO

NSO, Household socio-economic survey, 2016

3
SDGs and CSOs network

• Introduce and apply best practices such as methodology of World Vision International which use systemized method to upscale extreme poor families into sustainable livelihood at minimum costs
• Utilize CSOs to promote and provide information on SDG and MSDV-2030 goals and targets to local communities, trigger activities to evaluate the execution

SDG implementation in the local communities:

There is not enough information on SDG-2030 in Bayandun soum of Dornod province. It creates doubts whether the survey to determine the household livelihood level which creates the basic database to provide support to low income families is done accurately.

The local communities have poor infrastructure and no sufficient jobs. For the past five years, no budget was planned and spent to reduce poverty and support employment. 47 per cent of unemployed people are young people of age 20-30.

“Any population with a risk to be left behind?”

Case 1: Results of the survey conducted at Tsagaan Davaa waste disposal site...

Khugjiin Khelkhee NGO and the Mongolian Association to Support Women’s Labor conducted this survey in 2017 among the 94 individuals who permanently live and work at the Tsagaan Davaa waste disposal site. Individuals were observed for five days, 94 individuals were interviewed and asked questions. 370 individuals including 211 adults with 159 children had been living at the site. 67% of respondents were women, 28.7% had no documents, 47.9% don’t live on their registered addresses, 48.9% were not included in the study to determine the rate of livelihood. Living conditions of citizens living and working at waste disposal site didn’t meet the minimum hygiene and sanitation requirements. Eight respondents have been living and working at waste disposal site for more than 9 years, 27 for 5-8 years, 42 for 2-4 years, 17 for up to one year. 31 of them do not change their work uniforms, 44 don’t use any tools or instruments and do everything by hands.

Case 2.

Khugjiin Khelkhee NGO: Target actions to work with 42 children from 30 families. Children used to live in the streets who were brought back to the families. The NGO has been working with the homeless children since 2012 until today who live on waste disposal site, abused providing daily care service. The organization works with 30 families a year. 30 per cent of families now have own incomes and children attended the tertiary trainings. The NGO provides food and clothes for 60 children a year.
SDG-2.
Zero hunger

CURRENT SITUATION, CHALLENGES

“Food stamp” programme was launched in 2010 to support the low consumption groups of population. 135,413 individuals of 24,642 households are provided support since 2015. Within this programme MNT13,000 to every adult and MNT6,500 to every child are provided monthly. This measure targets to prevent low income citizens from malnutrition and provides an opportunity to receive required daily calories.

The National V study of 2017 determined that all population groups, specifically infants, toddlers, pregnant women are facing malnutrition. High vitamin and mineral deficiency is observed among children under age 5. 27% of children are experiencing anemia, 21% iron deficiency, 70% A vitamin deficiency, 90% D vitamin deficiency or have unsatisfactory levels.

Study results demonstrated common occurrence of imbalanced food security at the country level. Highest rate was observed in forest region (80%) and Ulaanbaatar (68%). 27% of households of Ulaanbaatar with children under age 5 experience serious food security balance which means that the poor population are in food shortage, failing to consume food at required level.

Mass food poisoning caused by food served in schools, canteens, restaurants, food factories,

Food packaging, liquid bottles are made of non-food PP designated for chemicals
• Unclear origins of imported food, unsecure food with expired dates, weak control of security
• Lack of integrated food supply and delivery service, lack of an independent laboratory to certify the food security to serve the public are still involving risks of unsecure food.

INCLUSION IN THE POLICY

Indirectly associated with the MSDV-2030, however, not included in the SDG-2 targets.


---

4 Food challenges of population of Mongolia, 2017, Ministry of Health, National Center of Social Health, UNDP
We observe shortage of pastureland and land for crops along with pollution of water and soil. According to statistics of the Customs General Administration Mongolia imported 74.8 thousand tons of vegetables in 2017 which is increased by 5.4 thousand tons from 2017. Demand for potato is fully supplied from domestic markets. 94.4% of grain, 52.5% of vegetables are supplied domestically and the rest is being imported. Ratio of domestically produced grain in the grain reserves has increased by 19.7\(^{\text{5}}\) points in 2017 from previous year. Lack of legal mechanism to provide compensation for the loss carried due to duplication in granting licenses for pastureland for agricultural purposes and mining of minerals. Lack of legal mechanism to acknowledge exploitation of pastureland used by herders in traditional means cause deterioration of pastureland, degradation and shortage of infrastructure\(^{6}\).

**PROPOSALS, RECOMMENDATIONS**

We believe that the following measures should be immediately executed based on the analysis of current situation including instable food prices, loss of food security, nutrition and quality, wide spread of GM products, uncontrolled production, supply and distribution of food, formation of improper food consumption and behaviors.

Conduct an assessment of food consumption of the population with risks to left out, secure rights to avoid from hunger,

1. Improve access to food stamps, ensure inclusion of all poor and vulnerable households with risks to be left out,
2. Determine whether the food program for vulnerable children satisfies the daily consumption of calories and nutrition, associated with other measures to eliminate children’s deficiency of food and nutrition,
3. Establish legal environment to stop and prevent from granting land licenses designated for pastureland and crops for other purposes. If licenses are granted, ensure compensation for carried loss and restore the initial designation and purpose.
4. Provide financing and legal environment to ensure participation of citizens and CSOs in food control,
5. Upgrade capacities of and access to an independent laboratory to certify food quality, improve human resources and technologies, provide certifications
6. To start production and broadcasting of regular TV and radio programs on the Mongolian National Broadcast to provide science based understanding, knowledge on food to general public.

---

\(^{5}\) NSO, Presentation of Agricultural sector, 2017, p. 107

SDG-3. Good health and well-being

**SDG-3.5. Strengthen the prevention and treatment of substance abuse, including narcotic drug abuse and harmful use of alcohol**

**CURRENT SITUATION, CHALLENGES**
388 cases of illegally making, acquiring, possessing, carrying, sending, selling and smuggling narcotics, psychoactive substances were registered in the past ten years (2006-2016) at country level with 1112 citizens being interrogated. Means and methods to smuggle drugs to the country had been becoming more inventive and such crimes are committed in more organized manner. The Anti-Drug Control Department has been inspecting 67 crimes involving 130 individuals since the beginning of 2019. Over 80 per cent of suspects are young people of age 18-35 which demonstrates the seriousness of the issue.

**INCLUSION IN THE POLICY**
Not reflected in the MSDV-2030.
The Government of Mongolia approved “National Program on Fight Against the Circulation of Narcotic Drugs and Psychoactive Substances” with the resolution #77 of March 7, 2017 of the Government and established the National Council chaired by the Minister of Justice and Internal Affairs.

**PROPOSALS, RECOMMENDATIONS**
To conduct national level surveys to determine use of drugs, psychoactive substances and risk-taking behavior.
- Proposing to create the following new indicators, including:
- Data on sickness, mortality related to use of alcohol, tobacco, narcotics, drugs and psychoactive substances, number of treatment centers to treat depressions,
- Quality of psychotherapy service on addiction to alcohol, tobacco, drugs and narcotics, create database on monitoring and assessment of activities targeted on reduction of discrimination.

**SDG-3.7.1 - Proportion of women of reproductive age (15-49 Years) who have their need for family planning satisfied with modern methods**

**CURRENT SITUATION, CHALLENGES**
According to the social indicator sample survey, demand for unmet need for family planning increased from 4.6 to 16 per cent in period of 2003-2013.
Factors influencing to not use contraceptives:
- Misunderstanding, lack of information and knowledge about contraceptives,
- Inadequate skills to discuss it with husband/partner, negative perception of friends and other close people,
As secondary and tertiary care physicians have no authorities to write prescriptions on contraceptives allowed to be obtained at discounted price from

---

7 www.police.gov.mn/a/4363
8 Qualitative survey on family planning in Mongolia, 2016, Ministry of Health, UNFPA, page 38
pharmacies, it restricts access to family planning service\textsuperscript{9}.

The report on support and service on family planning, Mongolia had significantly developed the medical care of mothers and children, however, left out the family planning. Lack of open promotion of family planning at three levels of medical care evidences the unsatisfactory level of family planning service.

**INCLUSION IN THE POLICY**

MSDV – 2003 includes a general provision to support quality and access to reproductive health care and service as the part of the target to establish accessible and high quality health service, but it failed to include global SDG 3.7.1 indicator.

An objective is proposed to reduce unintended pregnancies and abortions through improving access to family planning service that meets reproductive rights under the National Programme of mother, children and reproductive health 2017-2012. The objective set targets to upscale 48.2 per cent of 2014 of reproductive age women using modern contraceptives to 60 per cent in 2020. State allocated MNT 150 million in 2016 for contraceptives which is targeted to be increased to MNT 400 million by 2020. 70 per cent of women aged 15-49 who received family planning service (as of 2014) are said to be increased to 80 per cent by 2020. Primary care health organizations which serve with not less than 5 categories of contraceptives (2015) are targeted to be expanded to 50 per cent by 2020.

**PROPOSALS, RECOMMENDATIONS**

- Include questions in the Social Indicator Sample Survey to obtain detailed information on women with disabilities and other target groups,
- Ensure assessment of execution through including “Health support” criteria in the MSDV-2030.
- Conduct detailed studies on types, categories, brands of contraceptives available on the market, including costs, price, demand of each product, health insurance impact; expand participation of non-governmental organizations and private sector with relevant experience;
- Support family clinics and NGOs with medical insurance,
- Ensure provision of implants, injectable, IUD contraceptives under the medical insurance, make accessible at second and third level of health institutes, learn options to grant an authority to all midwives, gynecologists to write prescriptions.

\textsuperscript{9} Situation Analysis of Family Planning, 2016, Ministry of Health, UNFPA, page 29

\textsuperscript{10} Situation Analysis of Family Planning in Mongolia, page 20, 2016
**SDG-4. Quality education**

This target on education is directly associated with the 3.7 Supporting health, 5.6 gender equality, 8.6 decent jobs and economic growth, 12.8 responsible and sustainable consumption and production, 13.3 reduce impact of climate change.

**CURRENT SITUATION, CHALLENGES**

**SDG-4.2.1 Proportion of children under 5 years of age who are developmentally on track in health, learning and psychosocial well-being, by sex**

2013 SISS result of 76% demonstrates the decline from 2010 level (85.1%). Physiological and learning capacity development is rated at 97.8-99.0%, however, the social and psychological development should be addressed as only 75.7% of children are at normal level. Characteristics such as male, minority, special needs impact on child development to get low rates.

**SDG-4.2.2 Participation rate in organized learning (one year before the official primary entry age), by sex**

It had increased in 2016 from the previous year (66.2-68.3%) but declined back in 2017 (64.6%). 6.4 per cent of new students for 2017/2018 academic year are students entered at older age. The percentage of pre-school training was 79.2% in 2017 which demonstrates that pre-school education standards and investment are should be addressed. Roving kindergarten was introduced to provide pre-school education to children of herders, however, the attendance remains low. The development rate is lower than children attended the regular kindergarten.

**SDG-4.3.1 Participation rate of youth and adults in formal and non-formal education and training in the previous 12 months, by sex**

Youth Monitoring of Policies NGO did a mapping of access and approachability of life-long education centers and other state funded training organizations in 2018. The map covers 62 training organizations of 10 provinces and 28 training organizations from Ulaanbaatar. The map demonstrates that there are less training organizations in the high density ger districts but more in apartment districts.

Only 10 per cent of planned target group is involved in sport, culture and public events which leaves out the main curriculum activities of education and training.
**SDG-4.6.1 Proportion of population in a 15-24 age group achieving at least a fixed level of proficiency in functional (a) literacy and (b) numeracy skills, by sex**

According to the population and housing census of 2010, effective literacy rates were 95.2% for men and 97.5% for women ages of 15-24. The rate was stable according to the Social Indicator Sample Survey of 2013. Illiteracy is almost eliminated in the cities (98.4% for men and 99.2% for women), however, the literacy rate in the countryside was 88.2% for men which is the lowest rate. The literacy rate of poor families should be addressed which were 84.4% for men and 87.9% for women. Literacy was considered to the result of the primary education of the previous ten years which is one of the factors to influence economy growth.

**SDG-4.a.1 Proportion of schools with access to: (a) electricity; (b) the Internet for pedagogical purposes; (c) computers for pedagogical purposes; (d) adapted infrastructure and materials for students with disabilities; (e) basic drinking water; (f) single-sex basic sanitation facilities; and (g) basic handwashing facilities (as per the WASH indicator definitions)**

Proportion of schools connected to the energy grid stably remains at 96.6% since 2015, but the proportion of schools with internet connection to be used for education purposes has slightly increased to 67.8-68.4% as well as the proportion of schools equipped with computers for training (94.8-95.4%).

82 per cent of 34.7 thousand children living in the general education school dormitories in 2018-2019 academic year are children of herder families. 35,195 children applied for dormitories and 35,196 had been accepted. According to the study on “Current status of sanitation facilities of kindergartens, general education schools and dormitories” jointly conducted by the Ministry of Education, Culture, Science and Sports and UNFPA in 2017, 71% of dormitories are not connected to the centralized sanitation system, 61% have outside toilets, only 17% or 68 dormitories have inside toilets. 56% of dormitory students have an access to showers.

**SDG3-4.c.1 Proportion of teachers in: (a) pre-primary; (b) primary; (c) lower secondary; and (d) upper secondary education who have received at least the minimum organized teacher training (e.g. pedagogical training) pre-service or in-service required for teaching at the relevant level**

As of 2015, 95.7% of pre-school teachers, 92.7% of primary school teachers and 82.4% of high school teachers have attended the minimum trainings to teach. 2017 statistics showed decline down to 95% for pre-school teachers, and increase to 98.8% and 99.2% for primary and middle, high school teachers accordingly.

Indicators without official statistics:

**SDG-4.1.1 Proportion of children and young people: (a) in grades 2/3; (b) at the end of primary; and (c) at the end of lower secondary achieving at least a minimum proficiency level in (i) reading and (ii) mathematics, by sex**

Students’ test performance on subjects as following:
90.6% for 1st grade students with 60-100% performance; 85.4% and 88.3% accordingly for 2nd and 3rd grade students with 41-80% performance, 84% and 98% for 4th and 5th grade students with 21—60% performance. Performance rate is declining with grades and proportion of students with unsatisfactory performance is increasing. Required to define the most suitable training method, minimum reading and mathematics skills to be measured.

**SDG-4.7.1 Extent to which (i) global citizenship education and (ii) education for sustainable development, including gender equality and human rights, are mainstreamed at all levels in: (a) national education policies; (b) curricula; (c) teacher education; and (d) student assessment**
The institute of Education conducted an analysis “Global citizen education in Mongolia” of curriculum of general education schools, institutes and universities. Our study revealed that topics of global citizenship education, purpose and objectives of learning are somehow included in the valid curriculum of social sciences and civic education as well as in the content, methods, evaluation of activities to support education and training. Core curriculum of elementary and basic education includes less global and regional level issues but more national and country issues.

Review of SDG-4.7 inclusion in the education policies, elementary and secondary education curriculum, specifically in main subjects, of 22 countries of Asia, concluded that Mongolia included content of wellbeing, safety, security, peace, culture, environmental protection, sustainable environmental situation, human rights and freedoms, heritage; and capacities such as survival, cooperation, partnership, decision making, creative and critical thinking at satisfactory level. However, it had revealed lack of content such as economic sustainability, sustainable growth, climate change, waste management, healthy lifestyle, reproductive health, gender equality, balance, standards and norms, socialization, empowerment of girls/women, peace-building, understand types of violence, global governance system and progress, multinational corporations, terrorism, poverty, inequality, history of colonization, respect multiculturalism, diversity and dissimilarity, mankind identity and inadequate inclusion of integrated thinking, systematic thinking, global and local thinking, 21st century skills.

7,335 students of 186 classes of 25 schools are attending the 3rd shift classes in the 2017-2018 academic year at the state level. 85.5 per cent of 3rd shift classes are primary school kids. The number may increase in the future. Three of 25 schools with three shifts are in provinces, 22 are in Ulaanbaatar. This number hasn’t declined from 2013-2014 academic year. Number of student in classroom is 28.3 at country level which is 0.2-point increase from previous year, including 0.5-point increase from 29.5 of public schools. Number of students in a classroom exceeds norms or there are 35 schools in Ulaanbaatar, five schools in provinces with 37.0-53.7 students in a classroom.

INCLUSION IN THE POLICY

Results of the study on inclusion of SDG concept in the MSDV-2030, state policy on education, the Government platform for 2016-2020 of Mongolia reveals:

• Focus on education access
• Key concepts, principles to address livelong learning, equal access to education, education quality at wide scope and ensure equality in education are not included in the documents,
• Some provisions of the policy documents are not linked and conflicts with each other\textsuperscript{11,12}.


\textsuperscript{12} “Youth analysis” National Coalition of Civil Society of Public for Education, 2016
The key objective included in the MSDV-2030 and policy on ODA projects and programs for 2018-2020 is the provision of quality education. However, the documents fail to include measures to improve quality of education and measured only with the participation in international studies. The rest of documents except state policy on education do not provide clear provisions on financing, the equal allocation of funds failed to be mentioned.

Policy documents on education of Mongolia includes some provisions on lifelong education “to be suitable for lifelong learning needs, interests, talents, capabilities, development character, provide equal opportunities, to have alternatives, free and open”.

MSDV-2030 includes a qualitative objective to create lifelong education system but the definition of “lifelong education” is not provided which may restrict the current activities or only the activities of lifelong education centers.

PROPOSALS, RECOMMENDATIONS

Unequal access to education and outcome for every person is the reason to expand the gap of social inequality, extend poverty and non-realization of the objective of leaving no one behind in the education sector. Instead of considering education sector as development accelerator, many see the objective in relation to social development. The following activities are proposed to support quality education:

- Have separate indicators for number of students in a classroom for elementary/secondary, urban/rural, soum/provincial center, city center/ger district instead of estimating the average in the MSDV,
- Set an objective to provide mandatory one-year pre-school education for free at minimum
- Study and determine problems of children who didn’t enroll at all or dropped out from school, take immediate stable actions to eliminate it
- From the perspective to ensure common objective to include all children and educate all children, make amendments and changes to content, attitude, structure and strategy
- Resolve discrimination, marginalization, dissimilarity and inequality in access, participation and education achievements
- Provide opportunities to capable teachers, pedagogues with decent management to work stably to provide quality education and improve achievements
- To ensure citizens to obtain skills on survival and decision making to respond challenges and problems faced at international and local levels through sustainable development education and global citizenship education,
- Disclose information including statistics on education, budget, finance, projects and programs under execution and executed except students’ grades in the Management database of education, ensure access to information to citizens and CSOs,
- Take measures with direct positive impact to children vulnerable to air pollution, for example, vaccinate against pneumonia, improve air quality of public facilities for children, provide information on instruction to use high quality masks, organize information campaigns to influence public customs and behaviors
**SDG-5. Gender equality**

**CURRENT SITUATION, CHALLENGES**

**SDG-5.2.1 Proportion of ever-partnered women and girls aged 15 years and older subjected to physical, sexual or psychological violence by a current or former intimate partner in the previous 12 months, by form of violence and by age**

The NSO study on Gender based violence of 2017\textsuperscript{13} reported 14.7 per cent of women aged 15-49, 12.7 per cent of women aged 15-64 had been physically or sexually abused in the last 12 months. Proportion of abused women in the last 12 months is different. The highest rate was registered in Uvurkhangai (19.4%), Dundgovi (15.3%), Umnugovi (15.3%) provinces. The province with the high above average rates have no one-point service and shelters to protect victims which causes deaths of victims whose health and safety are failed to be protected.

**SDG-5.6 Ensure universal access to sexual and reproductive health and reproductive rights**

![Birth rate per 1000 girls aged 15-19](image)

**Unmet demand of contraceptives**

According to the Social Indicator Sample Survey of 2013\textsuperscript{14}, unmet demand of contraceptives had increased 2.6 times among teenagers (15-19 years) in 2010–2013. High rates of teenage pregnancy and abortion demonstrates the unmet demand of contraceptives\textsuperscript{15}. Proportion of teenagers (15-19 years) in total birth was comparatively steady in the last 10 years with slight decline in 2016, however, proportion of birth rates per 1000 girls aged 15-19 had doubled during the period and reached 33.1 per cent which is the highest rate.

Monitoring mechanism should be created involving citizens and NGOs to ensure provision of funding to all provinces and outreach of targeted audience. If HIV infected persons shall be included in this group to have a free access to contraceptives, the country can achieve the 2030 target rate\textsuperscript{16}.

**Maternal mortality**

Maternal mortality rate had rapidly grown in 2016 and declined back in the last two years to 2015 level. The recent maternal mortality study\textsuperscript{17} revealed more than half of mortality (54%) is directly related to delivery service including bleeding, sepsis, high

\textsuperscript{13} Naked truth of violence: Study on gender based violence, 2017, NSO, UNFPA, AusAID and Swiss Cooperation Office.

\textsuperscript{14} Social Indicator Sample Survey was conducted in 2018, however, the results were not disclosed. Data used in the report are referenced from 2013 study.

\textsuperscript{15} Factsheet on sexual and reproductive health-2018, Ministry of Health, UNFPA

\textsuperscript{16} Why mothers died, 2012-2015

\textsuperscript{17} Factsheet on sexual and reproductive health-2018, Ministry of Health, UNFPA
blood pressure. 45% of total mortality was concluded can be prevented if high quality prenatal, delivery and postnatal services were provided.

Social Indicator Sample Survey, 2013, monitored antenatal care with five indicators. the results revealed the proportion of women under the antenatal care was only 37.3% at country level.

Mongolian Children: participants of first discussion on «SDG-2030»:

- Organize regular preventive medical check-ups at schools,
- Create eco-environment in schools
- Build bike paths in Ulaanbaatar
- Improve quality of lunch served in schools and kindergartens
- Teach health lessons in a suitable manner for children
- Organize free of car day once a week
- Instill a new culture to do regular exercises
- Regularly provide non-class health classes for children
- Teach healthy eating classes

**INCLUSION IN THE POLICY**

SDG-5 gender equality is reflected in the concept section of the MSDV-2030 in general only which we see that this subject is left out.

MSDV-2030 2.2.2.2 proposes objectives to reduce factors to influence maternal and infant mortality which can be prevented through improving quality and accessibility of reproductive health care and service; and determined indicators and baseline rate.

National programme on gender equality for 2017-2020 was approved for the purpose to execute Law on Gender equality and implement Government platform for 2016- 2020.

The Government approved and executes National programme on Mothers, Children and Reproductive Health with the resolution 78 of 2017 to achieve the above-mentioned objectives.18

**PROPOSALS, RECOMMENDATIONS**

Objectives and indicators of MSDV-2030 related to sexual and reproductive health shall be measured with quantitative data which we see is not satisfactory.

Recommendation:

- Include SDG-5 as a separate objective in MSDV-2030,
- Include a new objective to create grievance mechanism to address the requests and complaints of the customers related to the accessibility and quality of sexual and reproductive health with the participation of client representatives.
- Include number of target group which received the free of charge modern contraceptive methods as a separate indicator for SDG 3.8.
- Include persons with HIV in the group of recipients to get contraceptives for free;
- Conduct an assessment on reproductive health for communities around mines and mine staff, develop protection policies and create legal environment.

18 Factsheet on sexual and reproductive health-2018, Ministry of Health, UNFPA
SDG-6. Clean water and sanitation

CURRENT SITUATION, CHALLENGES
According to population and housing census of 2010, 72.6 per cent of population of Mongolia or 1922.2 thousand people have an access to reliable water sources.

INCLUSION IN THE POLICY
MSDV-2030 2.3.1 set an objective to scientifically conserve at least 60 percent of water resources, river streams and water sources under special protection, and draw a medium-scale hydrology map for 30 percent of the territory.
Law on Population and housing census, Law on Water, 2012
Law on penalties for polluting water was ratified in 2012, however, now the law shall be amended without being applied.

PROPOSALS, RECOMMENDATIONS
• To execute vision of the National Development Agency to make a decision subject to ensuring multi-stakeholder participation in preparing development policy.
• Understanding of the water as non-renewable, irrecoverable natural resource at all levels should be a beginning of actions to protect potable water.
CURRENT SITUATION, CHALLENGES

More countries strive to increase number of renewable energy source and reduce impact on environment. Comparing to approximately 14 per cent of primary energy supplied around the world is sourced from renewable energy, Mongolia’s source equals to 4 per cent only. The global rate of coal sourced energy production is 38.4 as of 2016 and 54.3 per cent in Asia. Mongolia’s rate of coal use for the same purpose is too high or 92.7 per cent.

INCLUSION IN THE POLICY

MSDV 2030 – 2.1.5.2 provides to increase proportion of renewable energy in total energy production and ensure preparations to use new sources of energy. A target is proposed to increase the proportion of renewable energy to 30 per cent in total energy volume and to start using nuclear energy.

It’s unlikely to execute the above-mentioned objectives from compared analysis of execution of Nationally Determined Contributions (NDCs) of Mongolia proposed to reduce the climate change with the Midterm Energy program approved by the Resolution #325 of the Government of Mongolia on October 24, 2018.

We analyzed the newest policy document of the sector—Midterm Energy Program to ensure compliance of policy integration, financial and other resources in MSDV, Global Sustainable Development Goals, the Paris Accord and other pledges on combatting climate change and desertification.

Business As Usual option shall increase the national level greenhouse emission by 2.5 times by 2030 from 2010 or from 21 to 51 Mt CO2 eq. Mongolia pledged to reduce greenhouse emission by only 14% from BAU estimating energy production to be reduced by 10% or 3/2. Total result of reduction measures listed in the NDCs is to reduce by 7.3 Mt CO2-eq. annually (comparing to BAU) or in other words, instead of 150% of greenhouse emissions, the country pledged to reduce by 120%. This pledge is “fully conditional” or to be implemented and reduced only if international and foreign investment shall be granted comparing to other countries which are subject to “implement in any condition”, “to be implemented in certain terms”.

If the Midterm Energy Program shall be executed as planned, it shall have the following impact on NDCs:

1) pledge to increase sources of renewable energy in total installed power capacities to 30% by 2030 shall not be met (the most successful option of 400 MW renewable energy, if 400 MW hydropower station (the hydropower station with a risk to adversely impact on World’s heritage site and areas protect by Ramsar conventions) shall be built in addition, the capacities of coal fueled thermal power plants shall be increased to 9000 MW.

2) we estimate the greenhouse emissions to increase to 60 million tons of CO2 eq or double from current level instead of reducing greenhouse emissions as pledged by 14%. The emissions shall be increased five fold from 2010 level.

PROPOSALS, RECOMMENDATIONS

• Conduct an assessment on compliance of with participation of CSOs Midterm energy programme
• Conduct an assessment with participation of CSOs whether the midterm energy programme is in compliance with the MSDV 2030 objective to increase sources of renewable energy;
• Conduct assessments and estimate the NCDs under the conventions and accords on climate change, ensure compliance;
• Conduct assessments, consult with CSOs and ensure compliance of creating healthy and safe life conditions, reduce environment and air pollution;
• Conduct assessments, consult with CSOs and ensure compliance of sustainable economic development and credit policies with the SDGs

19 Energy efficiency and accessibility of Mongolia, composition analysis, 2019, NSO
20 Midterm Energy programme of Mongolia, 2018-2023
CURRENT SITUATION, CHALLENGES

According to labor force study of 2018, 1253.0 thousand people were in employment relations, including 669.6 thousand (53.4%) men and 583.4 thousand (46.6%) women.

SDG-8.3. Promote development-oriented policies that support productive activities, decent job creation, entrepreneurship, creativity and innovation, and encourage the formalization and growth of micro-, small- and medium-sized enterprises, including through access to financial services

SDG-8.5 By 2030, achieve full and productive employment and decent work for all women and men, including for young people and persons with disabilities, and equal pay for work of equal value.

The 2018 labor force survey results are shown in Table 3. Although 50.8 per cent women’s proportion in total population is higher than men’s, but the employment levels are below than men.

39.0 per cent of total population ages 15 and above are economically inactive population, 63% of which are women according to the labor force survey of 2018.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>By sex</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q-ty</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Population over age of 15</td>
<td>2 226 596</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participation level of labor force</td>
<td>61.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rate of employment</td>
<td>56.3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rate of unemployment</td>
<td>7.8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The survey demonstrates that girls and women do not have equal access to economy and natural resources. They work in low income sectors and paid lower salaries as well as there is lack of policies to train women to work in the competitive sectors and support them with specific policies to run business.

The analysis on salary inequality of male and female employees conducted by the NSO based on the 2013-2015 data of labor survey demonstrates the gap of 17.3 per cent of salaries of men and women with the same education. Sex of employees is said to influence the difference of salaries despite the same education and skills.

High levels of discrimination is observed in employment by sex and age. One of two positions advertised on the labor market discriminates by age and one of three job discriminates by sex. Proportion of employees with different salaries on the same job was 34.2 per cent, 79% of employees were mistreated on the work places, which are the violations of labor rights. Work place bullying and sexual harassment cases are increasing. One of three women face sexual harassment at job places. 98% of victims are women and 2% are men.

Many women are trapped in unreliable work conditions, their jobs are unstable, the salaries are variable and they cannot access health and pension insurances.

The weakness of social welfare system is failure to provide support to people who does not fall into any classifications of social care program criteria and who are close poor and close to poverty levels.

---

22, 23 Report on labor force survey, 2018, NSO
INCLUSION IN THE POLICY
SDG-8.5 is included in the content of 2.2.2 of Sustainable social development of MSDV-2030. The MSDV-2030 targeted to support employment, expand economically active population to 70% by 2030, reduce unemployment rate to 3% and increase the funds of small and medium enterprise fund to not less than MNT 300 billion.

However, no clear policies for social groups, employment environment and labor rights violations which are the key pillars of decent employment are included in the MSDV-2030.

The state mentioned in its policy on employment to ensure equal participation of people with disabilities and women, provide support through legal arrangements to jobs suitable for labor capacities, however, it dropped out the employment rights, work environments or decent jobs. The MSDV defined the economic activity and unemployment rates for each stage, however, the indicators for six programs to support employment failed to include indicators to represent increase of economic activities, reduction of unemployment which creates uncertainties to measure policy implementation.

PROPOSALS, RECOMMENDATIONS
Regardless of state policy to support employment, number of women unable to be employed due to reasons of “childcare, care for someone in the family” is increasing. We see the need to arrange and regulate accessibility of kindergartens, childcare service which directly impacts to employment of women along with opportunities to work from home and to provide flexible work hours.

Execution of rights to employment and equal pay, one of the key criteria for decent employment is not mentioned in the policies and programmes. These issues are not included on the indicators which may lead to risks of sexual harassment on work places, discrimination by sex, age and opinion, discrimination of pregnant women to continue in the future.

Direct funding was provided by the state to reduce poverty, support employment and create new jobs, however, the funds failed to reach the target group.

Funds of the small and medium enterprise support fund failed to reach the true owners restricting creation of jobs and ensure economic growth.

To measure the objectives to support employment:
• Execute the law to provide same salaries for same jobs,
• Include a policy to support employment of reproductive age women in the MSDV and policies and programs of other sectors,
• Listen to voices of girls and women, ensure equal participation in decision making, take into consideration employment conditions and their specific needs in development of procedures in order to support employment and businesses of girls and women
• Include a policy on employment value of the education, health, social service in the MSDV-2030, include a new indicator on employment rights, implementation of violation of rights, registration of complaints to be measured in the sectoral policies,
• Include indicators for national policies and programmes in the indicators of performance of sectoral policies, programmes and activities of subsidiaries, assess the implementation
• Join and enforce pacts, conventions of international labor organizations in order to protect and ensure labor rights of which Mongolia is not a part.
SDG-10. Reduce inequalities

CURRENT SITUATION, CHALLENGES
Reducing inequality is one of the challenges faced to our country. Four targets of SDG-10 are aimed to implement the key concept of the SDG to “leaving no one behind” to reduce inequality within the country and provide equally the benefits of development, prosperity, participation and social welfare. Therefore, focus on ensuring implementation of each target of SDG-10 is very significant. Target 1 of SDG-10: “progressively achieve and sustain income growth of the bottom 40% of the population at a rate higher than the national average” addresses to significantly increase income of the lowest income population.

It also acknowledges that the poverty is the problem of social structure and system and in order to correct it the target 10-2 provides empower and promote the social, economic and political inclusion of all, irrespective of age, sex, disability, race, ethnicity, origin, religion or economic or other status, target 10-3 Ensure equal opportunity and reduce inequalities of outcome, including by eliminating discriminatory laws, policies and practices and promoting appropriate legislation, policies and action in this regard; target 10.4 Adopt policies, especially fiscal, wage and social protection policies, and progressively achieve greater equality; by 2030 reduce to less than 3 per cent the transaction costs of migrant remittances and eliminate remittance corridors with costs higher than 5 per cent which are all clear targets to eliminate inequalities in the countries.

INCLUSION IN THE POLICY
The MSDV-2030 restricted the target 1 of SDG-10 as “reduce income inequality and expand the middle classes in the society to 80 percent of the population” failing to include targets such as eliminate discrimination, execute budget, finance, salary and social protection policies, reduce cash transfer payments. Therefore, there is a risk to not only unmeet implementation of SDG-10, but also to directly and indirectly impact to decelerate implementation of 60 targets of remaining 16 goals and to restrict implementation of all SDGs. The following table also shows that SDG-10 is not reflected in the 2016-2020 Government platform and its action plan, Three pillar development policy which is the main source of investment program 2018-2020 of Mongolia.

The superlative form is left out in the translation and being translated as “ensure income growth of 40 per cent of low income population” instead of “lowest”, the MSDV set a target “to reduce income inequalities and to expand the middle classes in the society to 80 percent of the population”. Furthermore, the Government’s 2016-2020 platform 3.3.2provides “advance indicators and methodology to determine income and spending of households, poverty rate to comply with life realities”. Action plan 3.3.2 to execute the Government platform provides “to revise methodology to estimate core indicators of poverty and determine livelihood levels of households, conduct studies in 2018-2020. MNT 14.4 billion is said to be allocated for this activity. The three pillar policy includes only execution of a policy to outreach poor households and citizens.”

We added the superlative form of low. This form cannot be left out as it shall degrade the results of activities to be executed.
**Inclusion of SDG-10 and its targets in the MSDV-2030, Government platform, Action plan to execute the platform, Three pillars development policy and plan:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SDG 10</th>
<th>Related provision in the MSDV</th>
<th>Government platform 2016-2020</th>
<th>Action plan for Government platform</th>
<th>Three pillar development policy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10.1 By 2030 progressively achieve and sustain income growth of the bottom 40 per cent of the population at rate higher than the national average</td>
<td>4. to reduce income inequalities and to expand the middle classes in the society to 80 per cent of the population</td>
<td>3.3.2 to advance indicators and methodology to determine income and spending of households, poverty rate to comply with life realities</td>
<td>3.3.2 to revise methodology to estimate core indicators of poverty and determine livelihood levels of households, conduct studies /2018-2020/ MNT14.4 billion</td>
<td>To execute policies outreaching poor households and citizens</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

“Reduce income inequality, expand 80 per cent of total population to average and above average levels. The income inequality indicator is included as “to reduce poverty baseline rate from 36.5 to 30.0” in the objective 1 to end all types of poverty in the 2.2 Sustainable social development, 2.2.1 Accessible growth and social equality of MSDV-2030.

The activities to meet the objectives cannot be observed.

Lack of definition of “middle class” allows us to conclude unclear situation: where we are.

**PROPOSALS, RECOMMENDATIONS**

- Eradication of inequalities is one of the challenges for our country
- High rates of financial discrimination, inaccessible loans, low salaries
- Results of social protection and welfare programs cannot be observed, programs do not reach the targeted audience
- Need for salary increase, elimination of discrimination, execute policies defining appropriate measures in order to reduce inequalities

---

25 We added the superlative form of low. This form cannot be left out as it shall degrade the results of activities to be executed
CURRENT SITUATION, CHALLENGES

SDG-11.2.1 Proportion of population that has convenient access to public transport, by sex, age and persons with disabilities

Composition of passengers is defined based on the categories of passenger cards used for public transports (buses and trolley-buses only). No details on passengers’ sex, age groups, and the comfort of a ride cannot be expressed.

No conditions are met so far to provide safe, cheap, accessible and reliable transportation systems by 2030 to vulnerable population, women, children, citizens with disabilities and elders considering their needs through expanding and improving public transportation. For instance, the city still lacks of infrastructure which is favorable for citizens with disabilities.

SDG-11.3.2 Proportion of cities with a direct participation structure of civil society in urban planning and management that operate regularly and democratically

Migration of rural citizens to the urban areas had significantly increased due to distinction between urban and rural development, gaps of livelihood levels of the population as well as the natural disasters, droughts and dzuds. Activities of large mining projects also contribute to relocation. Minimum requirements such as legal rights to own and possess land, accessibility and safety of housing, provision of education and health services, expansion of infrastructure access are not met yet.

The city is challenged to resolve management issues faced by large cities including apartment districts being constructed without social infrastructure (schools, kindergartens), traffic jams in apartment districts, clean water and sanitation. International standards and norms to ensure public participation, act in accordance with the laws, provide full compensation are not complied for redevelopment.

SDG-11.5.1 Number of deaths, missing persons and directly affected persons attributed to disasters per 100,000 population

The first monitoring report on the Sendai Framework was developed and submitted in October of 2018 using data of 2015, 2016 and 2017 in accordance with the digital method developed by the United Nations Office for Disaster Risk.

SDG-11.6.1 Proportion of urban solid waste regularly collected and with adequate final discharge out of total urban solid waste generated, by cities

40 per cent of the waste consists of recyclable paper, plastic containers, aluminum cans and glass bottles. 26 tons of waste was processed and exported as raw materials in 2017.

SDG-11.6.2 Annual mean levels of fine particulate matter (e.g. PM2.5 and PM10) in cities (population weighted)

Study confirmed that particulate matters in the air of Ulaanbaatar city have caused mortality due to cardio-pulmonary disease (28.8%), lung cancer (39.9%), and mortality of total mortality of Ulaanbaatar population (9.2%)\(^{29}\). Air pollution reached the dangerous level and the population of the capital city are polluted by 25 times more with the annual average particulate matters (PM2.5) average specified in the international standards of the WHO. Air pollution in soum provincial centers is at the high levels too.

Content of particulate matters in the air in Ulaanbaatar city is increasing continuously from the accepted levels for 237 days in 2011 to 338 days in 2018.

\(^{26}\) http://www.1212.mn/
\(^{27}\) http://1212.mn/ NSO
\(^{28}\) Transport Authority of Ulaanbaatar
\(^{30}\) Air pollution and health in Ulaanbaatar, 2018, NSO
SDG-11.7.2 Proportion of persons victims of physical or sexual harassment, by sex, age, disability status and place of occurrence, in the previous 12 months

According to the information provided by the General Prosecutor Office of Mongolia, 298 were sexually abused in 2015-2016 at country level. This is the only number of sexual abuse cases registered and inspected by the law organizations, however, there is no study on children who experienced psychological abuses. 48% of the children were abused by family members and relatives and left with physical and psychological trauma.

SDG-11.b.1 Number of countries that adopt and implement national disaster risk reduction strategies in line with the Sendai Framework for Disaster Risk Reduction 2015-2030


Report on reduction of disaster risks is submitted in accordance with Sendai Framework.

INCLUSION IN THE POLICY

Objective 2.1.5.5 of MSDV-2030 can be considered to completely reflect SDG-11.3.2, objective 2.3.3.2 is in line with the SDG-11.6, however, the Phase I (2016-2020): increase proportion of green facilities of urban areas to 15%, expand proportion of recycled waste to 20%, eliminate smog of Ulaanbaatar city are still remain to not meet the satisfactory level in 2019 which clearly demonstrates the failure of actual implementation of policies and programmes.

Objective 2.89 of the activities to be implemented in construction and urban development area in the Government action plan for 2016-2020 provided re-planning and development of Ulaanbaatar and other urban cities, to renovate buildings and facilities within the scope of development policy, execute projects and programmes on ger area redevelopment, ensure conditions to reduce air pollution. However the provision failed to include to deliver decisions with public participation specified in SDG-11.3.2 which demonstrates the lack of integration and connections between projects and programmes. Grounds and objectives to implement SDG-11.7.2, SDG-11.6.1, SDG-11.b are clearly defined, but yet no actual results are observed.

PROPOSALS, RECOMMENDATIONS

Majority of the state policy documents are focused on construction development only with materialistic properties which leads to a concern of leaving out the human development.

Provision 3.3.1 to enact policies to improve value, competitiveness of a Mongolian citizens of the 2016-2020 action plan of the Government of Mongolia can be concluded as it fails to take actions on the development of citizens.

Only once the economy provides an environment to invest, run business, create jobs and improve sustainable livelihood of the population, an opportunity to eliminate poverty shall be opened. The principal method to eliminate the poverty are the jobs and employment.

Future actions:

- Define the indicators to measure the implementation of SDGs as national, stimulate integration of understandings and definitions,
- Define the term for the citizens to comfortably travel on public transportation, replace the definition “district of poor”;
- Ensure direct participation of the civil society in the city planning, improve implementation of the policies and programmes,
- Focus on education of citizens of the capital city, develop citizens.

Directive A/184 of May 28, 2018 of the director of National Emergency Management Agency
SDG-12.
Responsible consumption and production

CURRENT SITUATION, CHALLENGES

Various actions and measures were executed to create responsible and sustainable consumption, specifically, policies and plans to maintain food and fuel reserves, yield per person, consumption of materials per GDP, policies on hazardous waste, chemical substances, agreements and deals on environment, exchange of information. The Government allocates funds with loans and bonds to execute the policies and plans and reports the performance. However, profit obsessed businesses brainwash public with advertisements promoting products such as soda drinks. Lack of understanding and knowledge about sustainable eco-consumption among public and failure of execution of laws and procedures leads us to a conclusion that eco-consumption yet to take some time to be developed and instilled.

For example, meat and fuel prices are too high, unfriendly banking and financial environment, low quality construction and infrastructure, hazardous smog, air, soil and water pollution, consumption, service and loans per person are in excess of permitted rates.

SDG-12.5 by 2030, substantially reduce waste generation through prevention, reduction, recycling, and reuse

2.3 million tons of waste was collected in 371 designated waste disposal sites in 2015 at the country level and 104 thousand tons of waste were disposed of in non-designated places. 68 waste disposal sites out of 357 designated waste sites in the countryside are apply landfill methods, the rest remains in open areas. Approximately 3586 hectares of land are under waste disposal sites and 242 hectares of land are under designated accumulated waste. Ger district of Ulaanbaatar city burns 81 thousand tons or a single family burns 450 kgs of waste in the cold season contributing to the air pollution (Ministry of Environment and Tourism). 2000-2500 tons of household waste is delivered to the waste disposal sites of Narangiin enger, Moringiin Davaa and Tsagaan Davaa. Landfill method is applied to dispose the waste.

Hazardous waste. Ulaanbaatar produced 10 thousand tons of hazardous waste in 2007 which increased up to 29-58 thousand this year. The data of 2011 survey determined 75 entities of six districts of Ulaanbaatar use approximately 871 tons of chemical substances of 400 categories.

Infectious waste of hospitals and treatment centers are collected separately and transported to incinerators. However, some incinerators, specifically in the countryside are not unsuitably located, and some use inappropriate incinerators which may have serious adverse impact on human health and environment.

Issues to resolve waste in appropriate ways:

- Lack of financial capacities to systematically resolve waste collection, transportation, storage, re-use, recycling, disposal;
- Insufficient detailed information and studies on volume and composition of waste;
- Failure to dispose hazardous waste in compliance with proper procedures;
- Improve engagement of state and private entities, ensure human resources, capacities and funding to execute the cooperation and partnership;
- No hygiene landfill to finally dispose waste;
- Lack of experience to neutralize and dispose hazardous waste;
- No trainings and promotions on waste disposal.

---

33 Initiatives, new solutions, new ideas of individuals and entities are required for reduction of PP container use http://mofa.gov.mn/ exp/article/entry/1440
INCLUSION IN THE POLICY

MSDV-2030 2.3.3.2 proposed an objective to improve waste management and determined stages of recycling volumes.

Disposal of waste in environment friendly means and methods are included in the Government platforms, however, no appropriate actions were taken to implement.

Legal documents including Law on Waste, National program to improve waste management were revised in 2012-2013 and sufficient procedures, guidelines to execute the legislation were issued. But the execution and implementation are unsatisfactory.

A decision was made to ensure detailed registry of waste to re-use, recover and recycle under the National program to improve waste management in 2014. The decision also reflects mobilizing resources of private companies. It will be more beneficial to our country to ensure legal partnership of the state and private companies at certain levels.

PROPOSALS, RECOMMENDATIONS

There is no program which adequately addresses the sustainable consumption to be meet the daily needs. All planned activities are remaining on the paper without tangible results.

85-90 percent of public employees, pensioners and herders have high-interest loans and lack of access to state, health and education services fail to support responsible and sustainable consumption.

Recommendations

• Ensure execution and compliance of legislation which prohibits and restricts consumption with adverse impact on human health, lives and environment;
• Provide trainings to consumers on public consumption, improve knowledge and information,
• Prohibit and restrict import of old and used equipment and technologies from other countries,
• The state, private sector and NGOs to jointly organize and conduct activities to provide education, knowledge on waste in accordance with the developed plans and methodology,
• Ensure private entities to be on charge of collection, transportation, storage, re-use, recover and recycle waste depending on the volume, composition and properties; state to organize activities to commercialize the waste,
• Attract and increase interests to be engaged in waste business, develop and support small and medium enterprises;
• Organize various activities to realize international principles “generator to be responsible”, “polluter to pay”,
• Get support and learn experiences from other countries to effectively organize measures to dispose hazardous waste in environment friendly methods,
• Ensure producers and importers to be responsible for reclaiming, re-using and recycling waste and packaging of chemical substance and some imported products.

According to the statistics of the Customs General Administration of Mongolia, the country annually imports 3.5 million kgs of plastic, 44 million units of bottles and similar products in average. 1.2 tons of plastic and 382 thousand units of glass bottles in average are developed into waste annually. As this number may increase in the future, we need to provide support to waste recycling entities and encourage entities which use recycled waste with certain policies.
SDG-13. Climate action

CURRENT SITUATION, CHALLENGES

Performance of goals to reduce impact of climate change are only at the starting point with more focus on improvement of the legal environment. This report provided highlights assessment of the SDG-13 legal status and inclusion in the national policies and programs.

INCLUSION IN THE POLICY

MSDV-2030-2.3.2.1 provides establish national capacity to cope with climate change, 2.3.2.2 support with renewable energy. The document failed to include main idea to reduce adverse impact of climate change, as certain impact in advance and prevent from climate change.

The document includes provisions only to cope with disasters once occurred and to protect from disasters, register and establish a fund. As the state makes the life-long education system to be responsible for an improvement of knowledge, education and human and institution capacities only, we see the state to fail to take a responsibility. The state fails to include it in the annual socio-economic development framework and relies on donor organizations without allocating and spending funds.

Measuring reduction of greenhouse emissions to impact climate changed as provided in MSDV-2030-2.3.2.2 with the number of entities which introduced MNS ISO14001 package standards gives an impression of a voluntary activity dependent on motivation and initiatives of the business sector relying on natural resources, failing to be a mandatory responsibility.

The concept to take immediate actions to reduce the adverse impact on climate change provided in the global SDG-13 is left out.

4.1.5 of the Government action plan for 2016-2020 activities provides five measures, however, no concept to reduce adverse impact to contribute to climate change, activities to determine impact in advance, prevent and cope is reflected.

Despite of the Parliament resolution to join Paris Accord on climate change in September of 201634, the resolution has no date for execution and exact number of the resolution. Provision 4.2.6 of the plan proposes six measures to be implemented. Although the state is responsible to develop policies and ensure revision and compliance of standards, no activities are included in the plan to request compensation from special license holders who failed to make environmental rehabilitation, hold them accountable, to allocate funds from the special fund of the Ministry of Environment and Tourism. Instead of the above, the state relied on the tax and international projects and programs. The execution of the action plan does not provide any progress as 2016 baseline indicators are not reflected.

National Programme on Climate change, 2011-2021

The program is under implementation for year 8 in two phases. However, the progress report is not accessible and transparent. Due to lack of financial and methodological support, incentive plans, responsibility system and participation of stakeholders to execute the national plan in the local communities, the expected results are not met.

National plan to combat desertification, 2010-2020

The plan is being carried for the 9th year in two phases. The National committee to combat desertification is chaired by the Minister of Environment and Tourism. The Government is obliged to submit the report on the execution of the national plan as the part of UN’s 10-year strategy to combat desertification, however, it remains unclear whether the Government submitted its report.

Green development policy of Mongolia, 2014-2030

Objectives and concept of SDG-13.2 and 13.3 are fully integrated in the Green Development policy.

34 https://www.legalinfo.mn/law/details/12109
State policy on Industrialization, 2015-2030
The policy to be carried for five years in three phases to develop the industrial sector into a sector to ensure sustainable development of Mongolia is in place. However, no plans for reduction of impact to climate change, participation of stakeholders are included, for example, no representation of the CSOs and Science organization on the Policy council on industrialization.

State policy in minerals sector, 2014-2025
Concept of SDG-13 is not reflected in the policy document of the most significant sector.

NATIONAL PROGRAM “GOLD-2” (2017-2020)
Despite the GOLD-2 program includes provisions to be environmental friendly, improvement of responsibilities on rehabilitation, it leaves out impact on climate change, elimination of consequences on a long-term along with the clear definition of business responsibilities and accountabilities. Control of policy execution is restricted with the Ministries of Mining and Heavy Industry and Environment and Tourism only.

State policy on development of petroleum sector, 2018-2027
The policy document has no planned actions to reduce adverse impact on climate change through development of petroleum sector and construction of processing plant, but clause 2.3.5.1 provides introduction of advanced technologies, equipment, international best practices and standards with less impact and to support green development.

Plan of activities for 2016-2020 of Ulaanbaatar city Mayor and Governor
No activities are included in the plan to raise awareness among public on climate change and ensure participation of stakeholders as Ulaanbaatar city, the administrative unit with the significant population has the most impact on climate change.

“WE ARE TOGETHER” program of the Umnugovi aimag Governor to develop the province in 2016-2020
121. To execute new management to decelerate desertification, increase participation of cooperatives and citizens, 122. Execute a polity to protect water reserves, 109. Establish mining information center. No activities on climate change are planned.

PROPOSALS, RECOMMENDATIONS
Analysis of SDG concept inclusion in over 10 national policy papers, sectoral and local policies showed insufficient inclusion of SDG-2030 in the documents developed by the Parliament, Government and other state central administrative organizations with higher capacities and in activities plan of local administration in 2016-2020.

Recommendations
• Instill practices to comply with the Law on development policy planning and Legislation, ensure engagement of multi-stakeholders such as state, science and research organizations, CSOs, entities to develop policies and programs, execute policies and programs in all sectors in association.
• Include objectives to take prompt and special measures to reduce factors to influence to climate change specified in the global SDG-13 in the MSDV-2030 and determine indicators.
• Include the promises to reduce climate change through ensuring compliance and links of other relevant policies based on the green development policy.
SDG-14. Life below water

An objective to protect water resources and prevent from shortage is included in the MSDV-2030.

SDG-15. Life on land

Following the ratification of the Law on “To prohibit mineral exploration and mining operations at the headwaters of rivers, protected some of water reservoirs” by the State Great Khural (Parliament) of Mongolia on July 16, 2005, over 240 special licenses were terminated which created a legal environment to protect headwaters. No information is available as of today how many special licenses were invalidated, how much land was rehabilitated and submitted. In addition to that it remains unclear which organization, including Special Inspection Agency, Ministry of Environment and Tourism, MRPAM, is in charge, no database, report on inspection and investigation is available. Decisions including 14 resolutions of the Government, two decrees of the Ministers were issued to grant land within the legal scope to fail to execute the primary purpose of the law.

The Law on Water pollution fees was ratified in 2012, however, the Ministry of Environment and Tourism failed to develop and enforce the procedure. By end of 2018, the law hasn’t been enforced. Therefore, no progress was made towards implementation of National Water programme, enforcement of Water Law, protection ecology balance of fresh waters, including protection, rehabilitation and sustainable exploitation of forests, marshes, mountains and dry land subject of international agreements. MNT 9 billion to be paid for water pollution fees is not collected by the state budget.

Mongolia established 21 administration units for 29 water basins but due to lack of experience and research resources, training of administration staff is important for the implementation of SDGs. For example, according to 17.2 of Article 17 of the Water Law, prior of granting special license on mining, a final decision should be made based on the recommendation of the Water basin administration but it lacks of database, research and capacities to provide such recommendation. There are no cases to grant special license based on the law provision by the MRPAM.

The water census conducted every four years according to the Water Law of Mongolia, 12% of surface water dries out in average annually. 8% of rivers, 11% of springs, 18% of lakes dried out in the last 13 years.

Mongolia registered 47 million hectares or 29.9 per cent of total territory under the protection between early 1990-ees to 2017 at various administrative levels. Region (corridor) for migration of wild animals with significant importance for the region and world remain in the 70 per cent “unprotected” part. The current regional division fails to protect environment for wild animals even in the protected areas.

The Government proposed considerable objectives in relations to SDG-15.3 such as to rehabilitate 70 per cent of regressed land at minimum, reduce decertified land to 60% by 2030. The policy targeted to reduce land regression fails to ensure participation of stakeholders. Inaccessibility of information, lack of cooperation and regulations, the implementation of the policy hasn’t reach any success.

---

35 Environmental performance report of Mongolia, 2018. UN European economic committee
37 Environmental performance report of Mongolia, 2018. UN European economic committee
Along with the overgrazed pastures, special mining licenses are granted on the agricultural land. 3074 special licenses for minerals are valid as of February 4, 2019, including 1681 mining, 1393 exploration licenses, 24 lots for petroleum and around 20 special licenses for processing plants\(^{38}\). Transportation without paved roads, failure to do technical and biological rehabilitation for mineral processing, irresponsibility of state control and inspection, weaknesses, high risks of corruption and bribery are heavily impacting on the pastureland. Mongolia still lacks of legal environment on rehabilitation and protection of regressed land and coordination of pastureland exploitation. This law is being under discussions for many years, yet remains as draft only.

Mining activities have increased significantly in the last 20 years which have heavy influence on citizens in surrounding communities. Mining also impacts air, soil, water and animal husbandry. The accrued impact of mining activities has adverse impact on health of citizens of local communities. Diseases which impact health due to mining activities include respiratory diseases caused by dust and poisoning with chemical substances. No assessments have been done on accrued and health and social impacts under the Law on Environmental impact assessment. The Ministries of Environment and Tourism and Health which are in charge of the impact assessments do not actively engaged in the process.

The Minerals Law restricts selective mining of high grade minerals, however, it’s common for the mining companies to mine the high grade minerals and avoid from environmental responsibilities. The Minister of Environment and Tourism in his interview in 2011 had mentioned that 46.8% of land under mining activities are left without ownership. The 2018 census of the left out areas reported 59 thousand hectares of land require rehabilitation. The state is said to provide funding for land rehabilitation. According to the 2016 environmental report, MNT 200 million is required to rehabilitate one hectare of land\(^{40}\).

According to the Law on the environmental impact assessment and the Law on Minerals, a company must place 50 percent of total costs in the special account of the state fund of the Ministry of Environment and Tourism as a guarantee to do rehabilitation and to claim back the funds upon completion of rehabilitation. In case of a company’s failure to do rehabilitation, the Ministry of Environment and Tourism shall contract a professional organization to do rehabilitation and required funds for rehabilitation shall be irrevocably paid by the company. However, the companies estimate the rehabilitation budget at low rates and place MNT100.000-2.5 million tugrugs and didn’t claim back as well as the ministry requests the rehabilitation. According to the EITI report, the special fund for rehabilitation deposit of the Ministry of the Environment didn’t allocate any funds as designated. The fund is estimated to have over MNT 50 billion, but it maintains only MNT 10 billion\(^{41}\). No information is publicly available and the Ministry of Environment and Tourism conceals information. Therefore, it’s unclear whether the funds are properly spent, and funds are collected from the companies and whether the Ministry implements the Green development policy.

Law on water pollution fee was ratified in 2012. The law is not being enforced for seven continuous years as the Ministry of Environment and Tourism hasn’t yet approved the methodology and procedure to calculate the pollution. Entities acknowledge the environmental issues which should be immediately addressed. 86 per cent of the entities accepted the arrangement that a polluting party should pay the fees and 90 per cent of entities admitted that the environmental issues should be addressed from now on which is greatly appreciated. The stakeholders conduct demonstrates the need of proper and integrated policy\(^{42}\).

---

\(^{39}\) National assessment report on gender of Mongolia, 2019, National Gender Committee  
\(^{41}\) Monitoring report of Steps without borders NGO, 2017  
\(^{42}\) Baseline study to determine understandings, knowledge and trends on environment of economic entities, 2016, “Association of Mongolian marketing study” NGO
**INCLUSION IN THE POLICY**

*MDSV-2030* proposed objectives including to become one of the first 30 countries to ensure ecological balance and lead with green economy indicators; to be listed on the 90th place with the package indicators on environmental performance from current 111; reduce the land affected by desertification from 78.2 per cent down to 68 per cent; increase land under special protection from 17.4 to 30 per cent; 100 per cent supply petroleum demand from domestic sources.

*MDSV-2030-2.3.1.1* To protect water reserves, prevent from shortages. Phase I (2016-2020): to get not less than 60 per cent of water reserves, river headwaters under special protection, establish not less than two large scale water reservoirs to collect surface water, develop hydrogeology mid-scale mapping for 30 per cent of the territory.

*MDSV-2030-2.3.3.1* To protect native nature, biological diversity, preserve sustainability of the ecosystem. Phase I (2016-2020): decelerate desertification, increase land under special protection to 25 per cent; forests to 8.5 of the total territories. All these objectives are planned to be executed in 2020.

Government action plan for 2016-2020: the Government action plan for 2016-2020 and the plan of activities to implement the action plan encloses the concept of SDG-2030. Activities better than the platform objectives are planned to be executed, but no results were observed in 2018.

**Local SDGs:** Arkhangai province developed and approved a policy until 2026 including the local SDGs with 44 targets, 70 sub-targets. The policy was developed in line with the platform for 2016-2020 of the Governor of Arkhangai province and the green development policy of Mongolia reflecting concepts of global SDG-2030. With regards of the indicators to measure the implementation, the province proposed to increase area under special protection to 35 per cent of the total territory of the province by 2020, rehabilitation to 40 per cent, forests to 18.5 per cent to have higher performance from the country level which we see a great progress.

**PROPOSALS, RECOMMENDATIONS**

**CONCLUSION**

We appreciate the inclusion of policies and programmes on water ecology system, its scope, for example, to protect, rehabilitate and sustainably exploit forests, marshes, mountains, dry land under its responsibilities to the international agreements in the policy documents of Mongolia. These policies include contents of international agreements and global SDG-15.1 at satisfactory levels. Data is available for the measuring indicators. Clear policies to combat desertification, reduce disaster risks, rehabilitate regressed land are planned to be developed and included in the MSDV-2030.

Despite the policies, execution of the responsibilities under agreements, policy documents, specifically implementation of national programmes and legislation are extremely unacceptable. Global SDG-15 target is within the responsibilities of the Ministry of Environment and Tourism, however, arrangements between other sectors and coordination of activities are not satisfactory. The activities could be deemed as for reporting purpose only implementing projects within the scopes of foreign projects and programs.

The legislation enforcement is also unsatisfactory as the legislation is changed regularly. Particularly the change of political conditions changes the “legislation on mining and environment”.

Under the Minerals Law, an exploration license is granted once applied (to be granted in order of application submission), however, public wealth is being granted in accordance with the Government procedure since 2016 (auction) which is the arrangement under the administrative act disregarding the legislation. In such situation, local administration and public participation is fully restricted.
The state and economic entities are not held accountable (15.1, 15.2) for the environment in the business sector. No measures are taken to hold accountable the responsible parties, the arrangement fails to perform. For instance, the UNDP Environmental Governance study highlighted that 60 per cent of crimes against the environment were discarded, only five per cent of such crimes were resolved by the courts.

PROPOSAL
- Conduct study on impact of documents such as Gold 2 and Three pillar development policy which are implemented by the Government of Mongolia and to amend the documents in compliance with the global SDG-6, 13, 15 targets, indicators, cease implementation of some policies with adverse impact,
- Immediately address the implementation of the Law on “To prohibit mineral exploration and mining operations at the headwaters of rivers, protected some of water reservoirs”. Ministry of Environment and Tourism to be the main responsible party to improve water governance,
- Define public role in EIA,
- Include representatives of CSOs in the professional council on EIA, disclose activities, MoM of sessions, decisions to public,
- Conduct mandatory accrued and strategic impact assessments specified in the Law on EIA of the Government projects,
- Environment audit activities are carried as the voluntary duty or at the requests of the investors rather than under the laws, therefore, audit economic entities with state ownership and Government projects,
- Introduce new category of “landscape reserve area” for matching protection purposes to rehabilitate regressed area covered by the State special protected area region. Create new legal arrangement to take certain area for this purpose under the state protection, improve ecological returns of the matching protected area,
- Create new legal arrangement to determine extent of ecosystem of the area to be registered under the state protection, no land shall be granted to businesses except traditional animal husbandry,
- Create a mechanism to support citizens and NGOs
- Create a mechanism to ensure registration of crimes against environment reported by individuals and NGOs to the state environmental inspectors and police, support their actions, provide financial remuneration to informants, keep confidentiality.
- Create an arrangement for consultative meetings to share and exchange information, ensure cooperation of the Ministry of Mining and Heavy Industry, MRPAM, the Ministry of Environment and Tourism, SSIA,
- State to provide funds to reduce desertification, restore and rehabilitate regressed land, protect biological diversity; expend fees for natural resources for environmental rehabilitation as specified in the Law on royalties; allocate funds of international projects and programmes to rehabilitation rather than for capacity building purposes.
- To develop data on hay areas, places for wintering and spending springs, livestock, people, springs and waters affected by mining projects.
CURRENT SITUATION, CHALLENGES

**SDG-16.1. Significantly reduce all forms of violence and related death rates everywhere**

Over ten individuals lose their lives due to violence annually\(^{43}\), which demonstrate that gender-based violence remains as one of the problems.

**SDG-16.1.3 Proportion of population subjected to physical, psychological or sexual violence in the previous 12 months**

0.9 per cent of total cases of physical violence or sexual abuse were officially registered by the General Police Department as domestic violence crimes\(^{44}\). This number demonstrates that the domestic violence is secretly committed which may continue and get repeated with a risk of death.

One year and ten months had passed since the enforcement of the pre-emptive law to combat domestic violence in Mongolia on February 1, 2017. Unless the state shall allocate required funds to enforce the law on domestic violence, we will fail to combat the violence. Majority of violence victims are youth ages 20-44 and their children. As girls and women experienced domestic and sexual abuse are left out or in the risk of being left, the policy makers must address their conditions.

**SDG-16.2.1 Proportion of children aged 1-17 years who experienced any physical punishment and/or psychological aggression by caregivers in the past month**

World Vision International conducted the program baseline survey in December of 2018 to evaluate the performance quality on child protection program. The survey covered 36 khoroo of 6 districts of Ulaanbaatar, 52 soums of 11 aimags\(^{45}\). We reviewed the information relevant to SDG-16.2.1.

Based on responses of parents or caregivers, only 38% (n=2152) of all parents used the positive discipline for their children. The table 9 shows that negative discipline which frequently used by parents/caregivers in a more detail.

Table 7: Detailed info related to negative forms used by parents/caregivers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>N</th>
<th>Answers by parents</th>
<th>All 10 methods of negative discipline</th>
<th>6 physical punishment of negative disciplines</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>N (%)</td>
<td>n (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Parents who use none of all methods</td>
<td>2152 (38.00)</td>
<td>4422 (78.09)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Parents who use 1-3 of all methods</td>
<td>2691 (47.52)</td>
<td>1149 (20.29)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Parents who use more than 4 of all methods</td>
<td>820 (14.48)</td>
<td>92 (1.62)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>5663 (100.0)</td>
<td>5663 (100.0)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Child rearing practices:** Almost half 48.82% of parents (n=2764 out of total 5661) and 48.1% of all surveyed adolescents (n=3130 from total 6513) believe that physical punishment is necessary for raising children properly.

\(^{43}\) Statistics of General Police Department, 2017  
\(^{44}\) Study of gender based violence, 2017, NSO  
\(^{45}\) World Vision International, program baseline study, 2018
**SDG-16.2.2 Number of victims of human trafficking per 100,000 population, by sex, age and form of exploitation**

Only the number of victims is included in the SDG database based on the data of the General Police Department, no detailed information such as sex, age group, types of exploitation. This may relate to incomplete translation.

The official statistics are based on the information provided by the General Police Department. However, the real life registry and studies show that each of two victims served by the Gender Equality Center NGO had appealed the police. If to consider the remaining victims as non-official, we can estimate the official number of victims acknowledged at the international level.

Significant gap can be observed between numbers of NGOs and state organizations for assessment of SDG-16.2.2 indicator. For example, 29 victims were admitted to the Gender Equality Center and provided assistance in 2016, but the Criminal Police Department filed 14 criminal cases, sent three cases for investigation and the Mongolian court resolved nine cases.

**SDG-16.2.3 Proportion of young women and men aged 18-29 years who experienced sexual violence by age 18**

Rights of 225 children were violated in the period of 2015-2018 who became the victims due to crimes of domestic violence. 132 of victims of domestic violence were children of young age. 65% of victims in 2015, 53.6% in 2016 and 57.7% in 2016 were children under age of 14.

---

46 Statistics on crime, General Police Department, 2015-2017
47 General Police Department
Parents participated in the latest study “Transparency, ethics and corruption issues in Mongolia’s education sector” conducted by the Asia Foundation rated the bribery and conflict of interest in the education sector as “average” or 2.65. Teachers, employees and researchers were more critical and rated as “high” or 3.7. Around 50 per cent of all respondents answered that it’s common to pay, use powers and relations to enroll children to schools and kindergarten, change classes, upgrade marks and rates. The researchers concluded that Mongolia does not have an independent, special organization in charge of execution of right to information. Public employee in charge of information has no full knowledge of the law and wasn’t provided an official training on this subject. No certain procedure on confidential information of the organization exists, however, the organizations still maintain strong culture on secrets and confidential information.

One in 10 women participated in Gender based violence study, 2017 was sexually abused, abusers were family members (29.5%), friends (19.0%), strangers (18.7%). According to the study of police, 37 rape cases involving minors were registered in the first 10 months of 2012, 54 cases in the first ten months of 2013, 298 cases in 2015-2016. Girls experienced sexual abuse become victims.

There is no special mechanism, standard to provide protection for children, psychological and social counselling for the girl victims considering their risks (Report of Association of Midwives and Accouches, 2018). Girls not only being sexually abused, but also deliver babies at teen ages, suffer from STDs. Children are double suffering in addition to the abuse due to lack of proper training for physicians to provide medical report as physicians avoid from writing medical report; expensive unaffordable legal fees, fees for diagnosing and treating STDs and other diseases, failure to determine psychological loss under the law.

INCLUSION IN THE POLICY

Chapter on crimes against children was added in 2015 during the new revision of the Criminal Code. Ratification of the Law on the Protection of Child Rights in 2016 prohibited any types of child abuse and specifically ensured rights of children to be free of any physical punishment in any environment. Mongolia ensured strengthening of child protection mechanism at national level and legal and financial guarantee to provide child protection service at local level along with the Law on the Protection of Child Rights. The National Programme on Child Development and Protection was ratified by the Resolution 270 of the Government in 2017.

Mongolia joined the global partnership to end violence against children.

PROPOSALS, RECOMMENDATIONS

- Ensure full performance of the mechanism on child protection in accordance with its responsibilities and focus on development of joint teams’ capacities to strictly execute the Law on the Protection of Child Rights, Law on Child protection;
- Ensure safety of children in life and online environment, directly provide understanding, knowledge and skills on risk prevention to parents and guardians through unofficial trainings;
- Instill conducts based on children’s rights to police staff, prosecutor, judges engaged in violations of child’s rights, child right inspectors, other state employees through continuous refreshment trainings at professional level;
- Private sector to develop and execute flexible employment policies allowing employees to allocate time for their children to support children’s rights;
- Improve staffing, financial and technical resources of child helpline 108.
CURRENT SITUATION, CHALLENGES

SDG-16.5 Substantially reduce corruption and bribery in all their forms

Case: Issue of ethics and corruption in education service

Significant amount of the state budget, foreign loans and assistance was spent for education in the last years, however, the conditions and results of the sector do not meet the public expectations. Civil society organizations believe that one of the reasons of such failure is the corruption and bribery.

Transparency International concluded degradation of education quality, inaccessibility, loss of equality which negatively impacts on the country’s development. The law provision to provide general education for free is not fully implemented in the Mongolian education system. For example, parents have to for school uniforms, textbooks, class fund, costs for school and classroom repair. Over 50 per cent of individuals participated in the study said they had given donations and paid money to schools and kindergartens. The consequences include discrimination among school students, change of teacher’s behavior toward students and even to drop out from schools.

SDG-16.10.2 Number of countries that adopt and implement constitutional, statutory and/or policy guarantees for public access to information

Access to information is the indicator for progress.

Mongolia ratified the Law on information transparency and right to information in 2011 and joined the Open Governance partnership in 2013 which demonstrates the country’s political will to strengthen the right to information. Although the law and the legal framework to validate the rights is comparatively good and covers wide scope, due to lack of law knowledge of state organizations, it’s a challenge for the Government to ensure full enforcement. We regret that the Government and the state organizations have restrictions on information to be publicly disclosed.

MSDV-2030-2.1.5.7 proposed an objective to digitize no less than 85 percent of public services. In order to implement the SDG-16.10.2, the state and government organizations should publish information in open and transparent way available online, the public organizations should appoint staff to be in charge of information and have a mechanism in place to process requests from citizens to obtain information.

One of the key indicators of global SDG-2030 program is to ensure multi-stakeholder participation. Any process aimed to be changed and replaced cannot be managed and executed solely by the Government or representatives of the civil society. Complete picture should be aimed to be developed to measure and evaluate execution of rights to information. Organizations such as the National Statistics Office of Mongolia, National Development Agency should collect information on execution of rights to information, integrate at the state level which could be used for development and planning of any national policies. Collection and gathering of data and information applying various methods to evaluate the execution of rights to information is the first significant step and it’s important to continuously conduct this evaluation.

NGOs conducted an independent assessment on execution of rights to information in Mongolia in 2019 applying methodology developed by FOIAnet or the Freedom of Information Advocates Network. Mongolia was evaluated as yellow from three rates of red, yellow and green with 39.8 points out of possible 100. The current conditions ensuring right to information is not perfect, however, there is a potential to significantly advance the SDG-16.10.2 indicator. The future progress shall be not only the achievement and success to implement SDGs, but it also shall fast-track the implementation of national development policy of Mongolia.
Mongolian Children: initiative of the participants of first discussion on “Sustainable Development Goal -2030”, World Vision International: Challenge

- High rate of violence in the family, school environment
- High rate of discrimination in online environment
- Adults fail to listen to opinions of children
- Insufficient understanding about violence

Solution

- Children to attend trainings on violence with their parents, guardians
- Every school to have a counsellor
- Conduct regular trainings on positive disciplinary methods
- Schools to have a system to regularly provide various information on science, technology

INCLUSION IN THE POLICY

The second item in the list of measures to be implemented on family, children, youth development of the Government platform for 2016-2020 of Mongolia includes to strengthen family values, reduce violence, protect individuals affected by violence, improve responsibilities of the family members, to create legally friendly environment ensuring children to be property owner since birth.

The objective 2.2.5 of the National program to ensure gender equality for 2017-2021 includes measures such as to combat and prevent from violence and discrimination, however, the reporting is not transparent, no financial, methodological support is provided to rural areas to implement the national program and participation of development parties is weak. The program is planned to be completed in 2021, but no measures to prevent from violence have been carried.

3.7.1.14 of the Three pillars development policy of Mongolia provides to combat with child violence such as to prevent children from any risks and violence, improve detection of crimes on this subject.

PROPOSALS, RECOMMENDATIONS

Violence against women is the most shameful human right violation, however, it’s the most common violation. No progress can be achieved to secure equality, development and peace when violence exists. The SDG targets 5.2, 5.3, 16.1 and 16.2 specify to end and eliminate all types of violence against women and girls and significantly reduce related death rates. As these targets are not included in the MSDV-2030 and included in other policy documents in the form of declaration, we regard that the Government of Mongolia pays little attention to this serious violation of human rights.

- Allocate required budget for measures to enforce the Law on Domestic violence, to create full opportunities to significantly reduce all types of violence, related deaths specified in the SDG target 16.1,
- Train professional staff to provide assistance and service to victims of violence with disabilities, operate free 24-hour hotline with accessible video call, establish national level shelters and one-point service centers for people with disabilities,
- Coordinate cooperation of the Government, CSOs, international organizations to end violence,
- For the purpose to end hereditary violence, make an arrangement to cover costs for recovery services provided by professional organizations and counsellor to a child experienced domestic and sexual violence by the health insurance fund and child protection program funds.
- Retain the provision on service to be provided to children, women, elders and citizens with disabilities whose life, health and safety were exposed to risks and who require protection in the draft revision of Law on Social Care,
- The Law on Human trafficking includes provisions to provide some services to victims of human trafficking. No details are provided to deliver such service. Therefore, to specify delivery of such service by the related laws and regulations including who, how to provide service, how the service shall be financed,
- No regulation on psychological compensation exists for victims of human trafficking, take certain actions to resolve this matter,
- To develop methodology to use unofficial number or registry of NGOs to define the actual situation of victims of human trafficking.
CURRENT SITUATION, CHALLENGES

**SDG-17.4 Assist developing countries in attaining long-term debt sustainability through coordinated policies aimed at fostering debt financing, debt relief and debt restructuring, as appropriate, and address the external debt of highly indebted poor countries to reduce debt distress**

The NSO reported that the total volume of foreign direct investment (FDI) and official development assistance (ODA) in the total central budget of Mongolia in 2017 was 65.8 percent.

Official development assistance (ODA) is the major economic force for Mongolia. Mongolia has been receiving soft loans, assistance from partner countries and international organizations since 1991. ODA received by the country from foreign countries and international organizations in the early years of transition into market economy reached surpassed the GDP by 1.6 fold. ODA played an important role to overcome economic challenges during the period of transition.

ODA equaled 8 per cent of GDP in 2007, declined to 3 per cent in 2014 and reached 4 per cent in 2016. Total assistance provided by development partners to Mongolia is USD 3.2 billion. Most of the assistance is provided by JICA, the Japanese international cooperation agency, PRC, ADB, WB, MCC (Millennium Challenge Corporation)\(^4^9\) reported the Development Finance Assessment in Mongolia.

As of 2017, WB provided USD213.5 million\(^5^0\), ADB USD 1.95 billion government loan, USD 237.21 million assistance, USD 149.4 million technical assistance\(^5^1\), Japan USD 1.191.35 assistance, USD 1.579.44 soft loan, USD 496.86 million technical cooperation assistance (total of USD3,267.65 m or JPY100 million)\(^5^2\).

Significant money was spent for some projects without actual results. One of such examples is the projects on reducing the air pollution in Ulaanbaatar. Many projects had been carried to address the air pollution issue and the Government had received MNT 147 billion (approximately USD 60 million), additional USD 60 m from donors to reduce air pollution in 2008-2016. UN and ADB mentioned in the “Policy recommendations for Mongolia on accelerating SDG implementation” MNT 68 billion in total was spent to distribute 175 thousand improved household stoves. The project reached 97.6 per cent of total ger district households of Ulaanbaatar city. Despite such measures, the air pollution wasn’t reduced reaching the disaster level. The Minister of Health highlighted “Various activities have been carried to reduce the air pollution in Ulaanbaatar without actual results. Cases of sickness have been increased. Cases of respiratory diseases had doubled in 2016 to 1647 per 10,000 people against 791 cases in 2000”\(^5^3\).

Foreign loans and assistance received by our country is the debt to be paid back. Mongolia has been receiving soft loans and assistance within ODA framework from partner countries and international organizations since 1991 and many projects and programmes were implemented in all sectors. Some projects and programmes have not been implemented within the deadline, some projects have no actual results. The state has a responsibility to create favorable economic conditions and opportunities. The state hasn’t yet developed structured policies and proposed goals to protect financial rights of the state and citizens whose rights are seriously violated.

---

\(^4^9\) Development Finance Assessment for Mongolia: diversifying funding of sustainable development financing 2018
\(^5^0\) World Bank
\(^5^1\) Asian Development Bank
\(^5^2\) Website of Embassy of Japan, ODA to Mongolia.2017.04.05
INCLUSION IN THE POLICY

2.1.6.3 of MSDV-2030 provides only “Establish a sound development finance system, restructure and settle debts without adversely affecting the economy and the balance of payments, ensure that the foreign debt is less than 58.6 percent of the Gross Domestic Product, and maintain proper debt and other financial thresholds by 2020, 50 per cent by 2025, 40 per cent by 2030 and ensure proper rates of debt”.

The Government platform for 2016-2020 includes a statement “Establish policy cooperation, legal stability, favorable environment for foreign investors, improve execution of international agreements, treaties, national legislation related to their interests, ensure transparency of all projects and bids in infrastructure, other sectors, execute Glass tender selection policy”.

No clear provisions on foreign loans and assistance are included in the Three pillars development policy. The documents do not include particular provisions to improve activities on soft loans and assistance, to increase efficiency and returns of loans and assistance within ODA.

PROPOSALS, RECOMMENDATIONS

Foreign loans and assistance pay an important role in the sustainable development of Mongolia. However, control on the implementation and returns of loans and assistance is not stable, the activities are not transparent.

CSOs participation in the implementation of projects financed with foreign funds and acceleration of responsible cooperation shall eliminate various violations, ensure transparent activities and improve returns of the loans and assistance.

• Include a new indicator in MSDV-2030 to measure foreign loans and assistance, returns of ODA in all sectors;
• Ensure financial access and establish related infrastructure, disclose confidential agreements on investment with strict terms;
• Disclose agreements of commercials banks which created self-advantages to public (TIKA-5, 1510-MON-SF projects to improve banking system),
• End confiscation of properties for unpaid high interest (24-96 and more) loans of 24-96 and more without court decision, ensure compensation,
• Ensure fair taxation on small and large entities,
• Establish democratic ownership, decent jobs, common and fair remuneration created by funds utilized under ODA,
• Stop increase of debt ceiling placing debt burden on ordinary citizens and taxpayers for repayments of previous debt,
• Stop political promises such as distribute cash, smokeless stoves, money laundry under the name of development of small and medium enterprise (chemical plants) and thermal power station,
• Widely use brand name “Made in Mongolia”, export waste less and value added products,
• Refuse from unnecessary imports, protect the domestic market and national producers with border and customs policies,
• Refuse from old equipment, PP and plastic materials to be procured under the name of international investment and Government procurement,
• Openly grant rights to international banks and financial institutions to operate in Mongolia, create fair competition for financial services.

Documents such as Doha Investment for development is not introduced for public. National producers risk their businesses in the competition with world’s large business.

Implement the promise to partner with CSOs within the scope of Paris declaration, Accra program, Busan partnership initiative.
DEVELOPMENT CHALLENGE: AIR POLLUTION

CURRENT SITUATION, CHALLENGE

In 2016, Ulaanbaatar with the population of half of total Mongolian population is named as the most polluted city in the world. Now the city became the city with the most PM 2.5 particles.

The MSDV outlined air pollution as one of the development problems and CSO network report endeavored to highlight the issue from the perspective of the health of mothers and infants. MONFEMNET national network organized XIII forum “Through Women’s Eyes: Air pollution and the health of mothers and children” in May of 2019. The forum is the significant contribution to the reporting of SDG implementation.

The forum aimed to:

• Discuss whether the policies and measures on reduction of air pollution and financing are targeted to reduce impacts and risk on mothers and children, conduct an assessment on the implementation;
• Discuss needs to develop policies and strategies required to eliminate risks and negative impacts on health of mothers and children, determine possible measures and policy advocacy guidelines to be implemented;
• Share initiatives, best practices, innovations and outcomes on reduction of air pollution risks and negative impacts on mothers and children, ensure reproductive health and rights;
• Discuss state policies, decisions, measures, financing priorities, advocacy guidelines, joint objectives and strategies on reduction of air pollution

*References from the presentation and speeches presented on the forum.

Picture demonstrates the official statistics on coarse PM10 and fine PM2.5 particles which exceed the accepted standards. Average concentration mean of particles exceeded 237 days in average in 2011 which increased to 338 in 2018\(^\text{54}\). Ulaanbaatar air pollution reached the levels to risk children and pregnant women, specifically children and pregnant women in ger district in the highest risk. These risks are beyond stillbirth, miscarriage, low weight birth, pneumonia, bronchitis, chronic obstructive pulmonary diseases and child mortality. They have restricted access to health service\(^\text{55}\) in existing conditions\(^\text{53}\).

\(^{53}\) Coarse particle of 10 microns are mostly created by mechanical activities such as construction, street cleaning, winds and storms, movements of humans and vehicles. Bacteria, ash, grime are included in the coarse particles.

\(^{54}\) Ministry of Environment and Tourism

\(^{55}\) Danger alarm: Air pollution and child health, National Center for Public Health, UNICEF, February, 2018
Ulaanbaatar air pollution reached the levels to risk children and pregnant women, specifically children and pregnant women in ger district in the highest risk. These risks are beyond stillbirth, miscarriage, low weight birth, pneumonia, bronchitis, chronic obstructive pulmonary diseases and child mortality. They have restricted access to health service in existing conditions.

1. Perinatal mortality

Air pollution is one of the main causes of perinatal or fetal mortality negatively impacting on fetus or neonate since the development. Toxic air impacts lungs and trachea-laryngeal airway and leads to premature birth, intrauterine growth restriction and miscarriage.

The gap between winter and summer mortality is 3.5 fold\(^56\). It means that 3.5 times more fetuses die in the winter season than in other seasons.

Once S2O (sulfur dioxide) levels increase in the mid and last trimesters of pregnancy and content of coarse particulate matters during the whole pregnancy exceeds the accepted level, the infant’s weight at delivery is reduced by 138 grams in average. When the concentration of coarse particulate matters and S2O is doubled from accepted levels during the mid and last trimesters of pregnancy, it doubles increases of preterm birth and fetus is born at 26-30 weeks. Once the content of coarse particulate matters and nitrogen dioxide (N2O) exceeds the accepted level by 10 points in the first trimester of pregnancy, there is a risk of stillbirth\(^57\).

2. Infant mortality\(^58\)

79 thousand babies were born in 2018 at country level, including1465 (1.9%) being born abroad. 77.1 thousand mothers delivered 77.5 thousand babies which is the increase by 4.3% (3174 mothers) and 4.3% (3200) of liveborn babies from the previous year.

1307 infants died in 2018 across the country, 2.8% (28) increase from previous year. Infant or neonatal mortality rate was 13 per 1000 liveborn in 2018 reducing by one infant from previous year.

3. Child mortality under the age of five\(^59\)

Child mortality under the age of five was 1310, increasing by 66 (5.3%) from previous year. Child mortality under age of five per 1000 liveborn was 17 remaining at the same level. MSDV-2030 targets to reduce the child mortality under the age of five to 15.0 by 2020. However, due to air pollution this target may not be met.

One of the main causes of child mortality under the age of five is the pneumonia. 1244 children under the age of five died in 2017, decreasing by 384 or 4.1% per 1000 liveborn in the previous year. 86.4 per cent of children under the age of five died of diseases, 13.6 per cent of accidents and injuries. 72.6 per cent died in the hospital, 27.4 outside of hospitals\(^60\).

Mortality of children under the age of five was 121 in December, however, it increased by 21 (21.0%)\(^61\) only within a month.

4. Medical disorders of infants and children under the age of five

Respiratory infection increased by 27 per cent in the last 10 years in Ulaanbaatar. The UNICEF report\(^62\) mentioned lungs of children of the capital city are vulnerable to diseases by 40 per cent versus children living in the countryside.

Respiratory disease is the main cause of medical orders of infants and children under the age of five in urban and rural areas. Pneumonia accounts 25.4 per cent, acute respiratory disease 21.0 per cent, influenza 10.9 per cent in respiratory disorders among infants and children under the age of five\(^63\).

10 thousand children were reported to have pneumonia in 2016, it increased to 14 thousand in 2018, reported the NSO. Number of children under age of five serviced by OPD in 2018 had increased by 76.8 per cent from the previous year or was 67 thousand.

\(^{56}\) D.Enkhmaa et all. Seasonal ambient air pollution correlates strongly with spontaneous abortion in Mongolia, BMC Pregnancy and Childbirth, 2014, 14, (1), 146

\(^{57}\) Impact of air pollution on foetus and small children, MD.Ph.D, D.Gantuya, Mongolian National University of Medical Sciences, National Center for Public Health

\(^{58}\) Social and economic situation of Mongolia 2018, NSO

\(^{59}\) Social and economic situation of Mongolia 2018, NSO

\(^{60}\) Health Development Center

\(^{61}\) Social and economic situation of Mongolia 2018, NSO

\(^{62}\) Danger alarm: Air pollution and child health, National Center for Public Health, UNICEF, February, 2018

\(^{63}\) Health indicator 2017, Health Development Center, WHO
The recent study data demonstrates that air pollution has adverse impact on foetus in the womb as well as on infant’s brain and cognitive functions development after birth. UNICEF’s paper “Danger in the air: How air pollution can affect brain development in young children” confirms that toxic substances with fine particulate matters in the air injure brain cells of children, adversely impact to cognitive functions development and leads to development delay and have long-term adverse consequences. The most critical development takes place in the first 1,000 days of life during of which the neural system matures. Pia Rebello Britto, Global Chief and Senior Advisor, Early Childhood Development, UNICEF had said that brain of infant and young age child has very vital and vulnerable and sensitive neural connections shaped before the birth. “Those neural connections form child skills to think, learn, memorize and capacities of language and cognitive functions. Adverse environment, specifically toxic air impact makes a child more vulnerable during the growth and development and restricts brain to be fully developed”.

According to the UNICEF report, adverse impact of air pollution on brain development of young children has same negative consequences which are observed on children lacking of nutrition, love and care or abused child. Specifically, this vulnerability is at the highest level for 1000 days from conception to 24 months, including:

- As the air polluting substance have ultrafine particles it is directly absorbed to the child’s blood, reaches brain and causes neural tissue inflammation crossing barriers between blood vessels and brain.
- Pollutants such as magnetite or magnetic iron ore in Mongolia enters to body through olfactory system and digestive track creating oxidation stress with its magnetic property and becomes one of the causes of un-restorable diseases of neural system.
- Pollutants such as polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons formed from burning of coal, fuel, dust, waste, tobacco damages neural connection cells of brain which is the foundation to learn and develop.
- As size of the brain of young children is small then adults, it is very sensitive. Even small amount of toxic substance poisons child’s brain more dangerously. Child breaths more frequent than adult and immune system is weak, so they are exposed to air pollution more than adults.

**Economic burden on health and medical service facilities of Ulaanbaatar**

Costs for health and medical services provided to patients with disorders caused by air pollution in Ulaanbaatar had significantly increased in the last five years. Costs for children had almost doubled.

If the Government of Mongolia shall not resolve the issue of the air pollution in the near future, economic burden on health and medical facilities of Ulaanbaatar related to children of age of 0-18 shall reach MNT24.8 billion (USD9.8 million) by 2025. It means additional MNT24.8 billion (USD9.8 million) shall be required to treat children’s disorders related to air pollution if the air quality level, population structure, health service system shall exceed the current costs.

2/3 of costs of measures on reduction of air pollution of Ulaanbaatar shall be related to children by 2025. The largest share of non-action costs to be spent for children of age of 0-18 shall be carried by inpatient facilities of districts. This can be seen from the overloaded hospitals treating influenza even the Ministry of Health made arrangements adding 700 beds and organizing all adult treatment facilities to treat children.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cause of medical disorders of infants and children under age 5, in percents (urban and rural areas), 2017</th>
<th>up to age 1</th>
<th>up to age 5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Respiratory diseases</td>
<td>37.3</td>
<td>42.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Digestive system diseases</td>
<td>10.3</td>
<td>12.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pathologies originated from perinatal period</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>10.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Injuries, poisoning and other certain illnesses</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>8.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Infectious and parasitic diseases</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>8.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skin and skin cell diseases</td>
<td>8.2</td>
<td>10.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

64 Danger alarm: Air pollution and child health, National Center for Public Health, UNICEF, February, 2018
Burden on families and lost efficiency of parent and guardians

Direct costs spent by families to overcome risks and disorders related to air pollution is increasing. Costs related to lost efficiency of parents and guardians taking care of their children is significantly increasing. Mothers cannot work to take care of sick children. 110,800 mothers took care of children in three quarters of 2018. The number of mothers taking care of children who are considered to be economically inactive is increasing. This number was 10.8% in four quarters of 2013 versus 13.3% in three quarters of 2018. Mongolia’s poverty rate reached 29.6 per cent, 907.5 thousand out of three million are living below the poverty line. In such conditions, children’s disorders have been increasing which adds burden on the family budget and some families cannot afford required treatments.

What is the cost of fresh air?

Frequency of children to have infections and disorders during smog months: results of survey collected from 800 respondents. Answering the question how many times your child is infected with respiratory disease in the smog months, 62.9 per cent of 768 respondents said 0-5 times, 30% 5-10 times.

Air pollution impacts on quality of life. “Breathing fresh air” is now considered to be “luxury life” expanding inequality in the society. More and more people started to think that ger district is the main causer of air pollution creating discrimination. Air pollution creates more economic burden on families with young children. No opportunities to enjoy rights to work, study, develop, to have secured housing, have savings, stay healthy. Many physical and psychological losses are faced such as health, time, opportunities to rest, expected child, stillborn babies and more. Loss caused by smog cannot be estimated and we are carrying irreparable losses. Hospitals comply with MNS 4621-2008 general standard and provide inpatient care for 5-7 days. It is explained with excessive number of patients and no financing is provided from the insurance fund. 50 per cent of drugs provided to elders and citizens at discounted price from the health insurance fund are non-prescription medicine. Drugs sold internationally at MNT1 is sold at MNT10 by pharmaceutical companies and health insurance fund discounts MNT3.

The decision to support financing of for profit entities through providing discounts for services of resorts, fitness and sport clubs which is claimed to prevent from disorders should be revised. Citizens and public has limited access to such services. The funds of the health insurance fund should be spent for provision of free medicine to elders and all services and treatments required for children. In order to resolve all these issues, the Law on Health Insurance should be revised and amended.

---

55 Statistical database, 1212.mn, economically inactive population of ages 15 and above, by reasons, quarters, annually 2018
56 Poverty profile-2016 study, NSO
Probability of school dropout and decline of personal income

Air pollution causes severe illnesses such as bronchitis, tracheal disease forcing children to dropout, learn, develop and restricting other opportunities and has long term adverse impact on child’s growth and development through deterioration of lung activities, capacities and functions, to develop chronic respiratory diseases. “Ulaanbaatar-Fresh Air” project, Mongolian University of Medical Sciences and Social Health school conducted a study on air pollution in kindergarten classrooms in which children spent 8-10 hours. The study had taken place in February of 2017 in the kindergartens #150, 51 of Sukhbaatar district, #43 and #31 of Chingeltei district. Study revealed that the installation of air purifiers in the classrooms of kindergartens reduced inside air pollution 3.2- fold and extended sleeping hours of children.

PROPOSALS, RECOMMENDATIONS

Policies and measures implemented by the Government on air and environmental pollution is more mid and long term focused addressing only energy sector and introducing environmental friendly equipment. Although it plays a role in reduction of air pollution but it should also consider thousands of children and pregnant women living in high risks. A strategy should be developed on immediate actions to protect from such risks. Increase of respiratory diseases in urban areas is directly related to the increase of air pollution during cold seasons. The 2018 report of UN and ADB joint working group to provide policy recommendation on the acceleration of SDG implementation mentioned high risks of adverse impact on children, pregnant women to develop respiratory diseases and foetus development which should be addressed.

• Immediately take protection actions to eliminate the adverse impact of air pollution along with the mid and long-term objectives to reduce air pollution;
• Consider the current situation as an emergency, give high priority on health protection of pregnant mothers and children who are mostly affected by air pollution;
• See the overall picture of consequences and solutions of air pollution, consider different needs and factors of affected people, ensure implementation of a strategy to provide full support;
• Ensure opportunities to provide emergency primary medical treatment regardless of economic capacities in case of sickness of young age child;
• Provide high quality medicine to treat acute
• Provide high-quality medicine to treat acute and chronic respiratory diseases to children of vulnerable families for free from the health insurance or at discounted prices;
• Health insurance to provide compensation to certified private hospitals for antenatal diagnosis, analysis;
• Review the legal regulation which allows citizens to go to fitness gyms with health insurance;
• Determine package measures to reduce impact of air pollution on pregnant women and infants residing in ger districts, make cost estimates.

Young mother: I am so afraid of growing children to make them feel smog risk dangers. There were nights when bronchitis couldn’t be treated with the best antibiotics which I could smell from sweat and I was thinking why I delivered this baby to make him suffer. I have two kids of ages of 1-3. They got infected with influenza at least five times between November and May. The influenza develops into bronchitis, larynx, pneumonia within a night and we go to hospital. This is not the childhood they want. I was free from violence and abuse when I was a child, and I am lucky that I haven’t lived by life with dangers of smog as today.
PROPOSALS FOR FUTURE ACTIONS

- Have an official translation of Sustainable Development Goal document, ensure its use by all,
- Inform the local communities about SDG, reflect in the local development policies and plans; assess and report the implementation, ensure voluntary participation of citizens,

On developing and improving quality and scope of information:

- Include an objective on gender equality as the separate objective in the MSDV-2030 in order to provide opportunities of equal participation and equal benefits in the development progress through studying demands of men and women and social groups, reflect in the policies and plans and allocate funds,
- Specifically develop target and indicator on sexual and reproductive health and include in the Sustainable development vision;
- adapt definitions, terms, methodology and replace the term “district of poor”, “stray people” and have common position,
- How to measure shortage? To create an unique definition of poor,
- Conduct an observation study at country level to determine risk behavior and use of narcotics, psychotropic substances,
- Ensure implementation of the principle to leave no one behind and include a question in the Social Indicator Sample Survey to have data on women with disabilities and other target groups,
- Develop an indicator for SDG 3.7 ensuring quantity of specially trained teachers to teach subject on health
- Develop an indicator for SDG 3.8 ensuring quantity of target group with access to modern contraceptives,
- SDG-8: create detailed data on jobs and professions,
- Create new indicators for population, livestock, areas for hay, places for winter and spring seasons, waters and springs for the communities impacted by mining projects

Proposals related to translation of indicators:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Original version of Global SDG</th>
<th>Current version</th>
<th>Proposed version by CSOs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>16.2 End abuse, exploitation, trafficking and all forms of violence against and torture of children</td>
<td>16.2 Хүүхэдтай зэрлэгээр харьцах, таднийг малжих, наймаалах, тамлан зовоох, хүүхдийн эсрэг хүнчирхийллүүг бүх хэлбэрээр зөгсөөг устаах (1212.mn)</td>
<td>16.2: Хүүхдийн эсрэг дарангуйлал, хүүхдийн малжлаг, хүү бус наймаа, хүчирхийллүүг бүх хэлбэр, хүүхдийг тарчлан зөөхөөр ядралыг зөгсөөх (тайлан бичсэн бүлэг)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.2.2 Number of victims of human trafficking per 100,000 population, by sex, age and form of exploitation</td>
<td>16.2.2 100,000 хүн нэгдсэн хүн худалдаалал гэмт хэрэгцийн хохирогчдын тоо</td>
<td>16.2-2 100,000 хүнд нэгдсэн хүн худалдаалал гэмт хэрэгцийн хохирогчдын тоо, хүйс, насны бүлэг, малжлагийн хэлбэрээр</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.1 By 2030 progressively achieve and sustain income growth of the bottom 40% of the population at a rate higher than the national average</td>
<td>10.1 2030 он гээд бага орлоготой хүн амьын 40 хувийн орлогын өсэлтийг үндээн дүнжяас дээгүүр түвшинд ажирмаар хүрээж, хадгалах</td>
<td>... хамгийн бага орлоготой... Хэрэгжилтийн үр дүнг бууруулал тул &quot;Хамгийн&quot; гэсэн улс орхийг боловгүй.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
About Centre for Human Rights and Development NGO

The CHRD is a non-governmental organization operates as not-for-profit, public-benefit organization for the purpose of promoting and protecting human rights and social justice in Mongolia.

The CHRD aims at a developed Mongolia where every individual enjoys the right to participation and development. The motto is development through human rights. It believes in fulfillment of human rights as the prerequisite condition for poverty reduction, protection of ecological balance and sustainable development. People’s participation in formulation, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of national and local development policies, programs and projects is the sole purpose of ensuring that everyone equally benefits from the result of development.

Contact us:
Address: Room 1103, 11th floor, Peace Tower, Peace Avenue-54, 3rd khoroo, Chingeltei district, Ulaanbaatar-15172,
Post address: POB-551, Central Post Office, Ulaanbaatar-15160, Mongolia
Tel/Fax: (976) 11-325721
Email: chrd@mongolnet.mn
Website: www.chrd.org.mn
Facebook: https://www.facebook.com/chrdmongolia